



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

25 AUG 2019

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 1235)

Name of Candidate	ARCHIT NIGAM	Registration Number	104282
Medium Hindi/Eng.	ENGLISH	Date	24/8/19
Center	ORN - DELHI		

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are **FOURTEEN** questions printed in **ENGLISH & HINDI** इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.**
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

16-B, 2nd Floor, Above National Trust Building, Bada Bazar Marg, Old Rajinder Nagar, Delhi-110060

Plot No. 857, 1st Floor, Banda Bahadur Marg (Opp Punjab & Sindh Bank), Dr. Mukherjee Nagar
Delhi- 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Contextual Competence
2. Content Competence
3. Language Competence
4. Introduction Competence
5. Structure - Presentation Competence
6. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

SECTION – A

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. Given below are two quotations. For each of these bring out what it means to you in the present context.

नीचे दो उद्धरण दिए गए हैं। इनमें से प्रत्येक का वर्तमान संदर्भ में आपके लिए क्या महत्व है, स्पष्ट कीजिए।

(a) The golden rule of conduct is mutual toleration, seeing that we will never all think alike and we shall always see Truth in fragment and from different points of vision. Mahatma Gandhi. 10

यह जानते हुए कि हम सब एक जैसा नहीं सोचेंगे और हम सदैव सत्य को खंडों में और विभिन्न दृष्टिकोणों से देखेंगे, आचरण का सुनहरा नियम पारस्परिक सहिष्णुता है। महात्मा गांधी।

The above quote by Gandhiji is towards the perception of reality as it is vast, unorganised and diverse.

The above quote refers to different conceptions of truth from the perspectives of various actors in a social setting.

Differences in values, norms, socialisation, culture, prejudices, stereotypes etc give different meanings to the same phenomena.

Mutual tolerance comes from empathy and empathy comes from recognition of the pain and sufferings of others.

Breakdown of pluralistic ignorance
and silos of existence leads to
sensitization towards the needs of others
leading to a more inclusive society.

eg:- Different perceptions of a multipurpose
hydropower project

<u>Urban youth</u>	<u>Local youth</u>	<u>Tribal youth</u>
① More availability of water ② More availability of electricity ③ Infrastructure development	① Acquisition of land ② Displacement from homes ③ Employment opportunities ④ Monetary incentive	① Loss of ancestral land ② Loss of livelihood ③ Exploitation and alienation ④ Detribalisation

Reality and truth is like a
mosaic, it needs to be pieced together
to gather the complete reality
which makes decision making easier
and ethical.

1. (b) The mind of the superior man is conversant with righteousness; the mind of the mean man is conversant with gain. Confucius. **10**

श्रेष्ठतर व्यक्ति की बुद्धि न्याय परायणता में दक्ष होती है; जबकि तुच्छ व्यक्ति की बुद्धि लाभोन्मुख होती है। कन्फ्यूशियस।

The above quote reflects upon the dilemma of action a person faces when he is tasked with choice making.

The Superior man addressed to here by Confucius is the one who keeps aside personal gain, temporary gratification, utilitarianism and sensual motive when he/she decides on a course of action.

The mean man on the other hand prefers to behave in a way that leads to quick gratification, profit, gain, pleasure etc.

Conversing with righteousness here refers to a back and forth cost benefit analysis that takes place before deciding upon the consequences of an action.

Guided by the light of righteousness a person makes a decision that is aligned to the ethical and moral standard that does not focus on petty gain but the good of the larger society.

Conversation with gain breeds selfishness, unethical, immoral behaviour that gives rise to particularism, corruption, crony capitalism, nepotism, communalism etc

The head of the house for the society are people who follow the path of righteousness that are the standard bearers of philanthropy, charity, social work, activism and an asset to the society.

2. (a) Impersonal management, a characteristic feature of a Weberian bureaucracy, develops over time into indifference, especially with regard to weaker sections of the society. Critically discuss. **10**

वेबर की नौकरशाही की एक विशिष्ट विशेषता, अवैयक्तिक प्रबंधन, समय के साथ विशेष रूप से समाज के कमजोर वर्गों के संबंध में उदासीनता के रूप में विकसित हो जाती है। समालोचनात्मक चर्चा कीजिए।

The weberian model of Bureaucracy was conceptualised to be efficient, rational, non partisan and professional.

Modern Bureaucracies are the hallmarks of industrial societies that need the cooperation of various sections of the society and an enforcer of the laws.

Weberian model underlined the importance of impersonal management that reflects on value neutrality and rationality.

Over time this feature converts into indifference converting the bureaucracy into apathetic, bureaucratic, rigid and inflexible, red tape and non responsive to people's needs.

More often than not this indifference is seen with respect to the weaker sections as they are often less represented in bureaucracy, voiceless, have less bargaining power, literacy, awareness and monetary power.

This indifference is manifested in the form of biases, prejudices, misconceptions, etc which place these sections as inferior and underscoring of empathetic liaison.

eg:- Poor representation of SC/STs in higher bureaucracies have led to poor action against crimes against SC/ST. Similarly in the case of women.

This impersonal management creates an iron cage of rationality that needs to be broken for achieving the true mandate of bureaucracy.

2. (b) In pursuit of political power, means are often compromised that leads to competitive reliance on unethical practices resulting in erosion of public trust. Discuss. 10

राजनीतिक सत्ता के अनुसरण में, प्रायः साधनों से समझौता किया जाता है जिससे अनैतिक व्यवहारों के प्रति प्रतिस्पर्धात्मक निर्भरता पैदा होती है, जिसके परिणामस्वरूप सार्वजनिक विश्वास का क्षरण होता है। चर्चा कीजिए।

India's constitution provides for a representative democracy that is founded on the principle of free and fair elections

In pursuit of political power the politicians often resort to the adage that the ends justify the means and in this quest resort to unethical practices such as:-

- ① Corruption and black money → especially in political funding, allocation of seats, party tickets etc
- ② Criminalization of politics → As the winnability of candidates with muscle power is higher
- ③ Crony Capitalism → Money from large industrialists to gain favourable policies

④ Vote Bank politics → different groups are propped up against each other leading to social tension & fissures

⑤ Communalism / Regionalism / Secessionism

⑥ Populism → Sops such as loan waivers, free electricity, subsidy etc is a way of buying votes using taxpayer money

Democratic politics often resorts to these tendencies, it is the responsibility of the structural safeguards to enhance the public trust.

Creation of code of conduct for MPs, enhancing the ambit of Model code of conduct, powers of ECI, citizen awareness and literacy are the best way forward.

3. (a) It takes more than a corporate governance policy to inspire ethical behavior and sustain a truly ethical workplace. Discuss. 10

नैतिक व्यवहार को प्रेरित करने और कार्यस्थल को सही अर्थों में नीतिपरक बनाए रखने हेतु कॉर्पोरेट शासन नीति से कहीं अधिक की आवश्यकता है। चर्चा कीजिए।

Corporate governance refers to the standards of operation, administration and functioning that are based on principles of propriety, welfare of shareholders, profitability and giving back to community.

With the economic reforms of 1991 the scale of private sector participation has introduced the discourse of corporate governance. Scams and incidents of misgovernance such as Satyam Scam, Kingfisher airlines, Ketan Parikh Scam, IL&FS are examples that recognise a need for reform.

The govt has taken various steps such as coming out with corporate governance policy, legislations such as the Companies Act, Corporate Social Responsibility, Auditing and ratings system etc.

However structural changes that are not accompanied with value transformation often lead to unsustainable models because of internal resistance from the actors.

A mere corporate governance policy only gives the framework, its interpretation and implementation needs the ethical and moral compass of the employees and board of directors.

Steps such as creation of code of ethics and code of conduct, grievance redressal mechanism, stockholding ~~at~~ options to make the employees stakeholders of the welfare of the company are good steps. They need to be accompanied by sensitization, education and awareness workshops to holistically address corporate governance.

3. (b) "Law should be so succinct that it can be carried in the pocket of the coat and it should be so simple that it can be understood by a peasant." Discuss. 10

"विधि इतनी सारगर्भित (संक्षिप्त) होनी चाहिए कि इसे कोट की जेब में रखा जा सके और इसे इतना सरल होना चाहिए कि इसे एक किसान भी समझ सके।" चर्चा कीजिए।

The above statement refers to the desirability of succinct and simple laws for the empowerment of the masses. Legislators over the world have a tendency to create complicated, lengthy and multiple laws that is very aptly seen in the case of India.

- ① Multiplicity of laws → Multiple laws lead to ~~com~~ confusion, high cost of compliance, lack of ease of doing business. etc
- ② Complexity of laws → High degree of complexity leads to high ambiguity, litigation costs, judicial pendency and lack of access to justice.

Consequences |

- ① Impacts access to justice as people become dependent on lawyers to understand laws.
- ② Ambiguity can lead to misuse and exploitation ~~that~~ that is legal as per the law.
- ③ law becomes the monopoly of a class rather than the masses which leads to erosion of trust
- ④ Alienates people, rise in militancy, social movements, secessionism etc

A law needs to protect the rights of the people and create a system of checks and balances. If it loses its intrinsic value if it does not percolate to the grassroots to make the people stakeholders in its implementation.

4. (a) Ethics in international relations has the potential to cater to the diplomatic challenges of 21st century. Examine. 10

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के परिप्रेक्ष्य में नीतिशास्त्र में 21वीं सदी की कूटनीतिक चुनौतियों से निपटने का सामर्थ्य है। परीक्षण कीजिए।

The 21st century has thrown up new challenges with the advent of Globalisation, capitalism and technology. With greater inter connectivity and mutual co-dependence the sphere of international relations takes utmost importance.

Nowadays especially after the rise of Donald Trump and nationalist right wing leaders in countries like Poland, Russia, Turkey, Brazil etc international relations have acquired a transactional character.

- ① Trade wars → where efforts to boost profits for ~~domestic~~ domestic economy undermines global consensus
- ② Using the threat of sanctions →
eg:- USA on Iran and Russia to make them fall in line.

③ Great game → new arenas of conflict such as Syria, Yemen, Sudan, Afghanistan that are driven by global powers for personal gain neglecting the suffering of local population.

④ Climate change collaboration has suffered a blow due to withdrawal of USA from Paris Agreement

⑤ Exploitation of 3rd world nations has led to reactionary movements like Posco movement of Odisha by tribals.

Ethics in international relations would help in creating a model that leads to welfare of all Stakeholders based on consensus approach. It would make dealings more empathetic, sensitized and accommodative giving strategic autonomy to countries for pursuing the best interests of their people.

4. (b) Nolan Committee provides for one of the most comprehensive statements of what constitutes ethical standards for holders of public office. Elaborate. **10**

सार्वजनिक पदधारकों के लिए नैतिक मानक क्या हैं, नोलन समिति इसका एक सर्वाधिक विशद विवरण प्रदान करती है। सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए।

5. (a) The sharper the socio-economic disparities, the greater the incentive towards corruption. Analyse. 10

सामाजिक-आर्थिक विषमताएं जितनी तीव्र होंगी, भ्रष्टाचार के प्रति प्रोत्साहन उतना ही अधिक होगा। विश्लेषण कीजिए।

Corruption refers to the illegal appropriation of monetary incentives, perks, privileges, resources etc in return for a quid pro quo understanding.

Corruption is a tool for personal gain, aggrandisement, prosperity, luxury, status etc. It offers a shortcut that gives us what we need in a short time with minimal effort.

Corruption incidence has taken an upward swing with sharpening of socio economic disparities.

- ① Mass poverty, the recent oxfam report finds that the top 1% of the population controls more than 70% of the wealth in India.

- ② Increase in cost of living making the daily wages or salaries inadequate to fulfill desires
- ③ Increase in consumerist culture which creates a heart burn in the deprived sections pushing them towards corruption.

The most effective way to tackle corruption is not increased vigilance rather socio economic parity and inclusive development.

Developmental economists such as Jean Dreze have found greater honesty in bureaucrats of Scandinavian countries that have reached levels of inclusivity not seen anywhere else.

5. (b) The moral worth of an action depends not on the consequences that flow from it, but on its motivation. Explain the statement with the help of suitable examples. 10

किसी कार्यवाही का नैतिक मूल्य इससे प्राप्त होने वाले परिणामों पर नहीं, बल्कि उसकी अभिप्रेरणा पर निर्भर करता है। उपयुक्त उदाहरणों की सहायता से इस कथन की व्याख्या कीजिए।

The Deontological school of ethics believes in the ethicality and morality of actions in isolation separated from their intended outcomes or consequences.

eg:- ① Use of bribes to increase efficiency in bureaucratic work
[referred to as greasing of wheels]

② Use of Curfew or Sec 144 to maintain social order over long periods of time.

③ Increasing surveillance especially on digital platform to counter terrorism & radicalisation but at the cost of privacy.

In all the above examples despite the end result being good and noble the means used are unethical and detached from principles of liberalism, constitutionalism and rule of law.

Deontology offers an escape mechanism that creates an illusion of good for the actor ignoring the structural deficiencies, problems and inadequacies. It papers over the cracks giving a rosy picture over a fragmented wall.

Ultimately the moral worth of action is seen from both the ends but also the means and motivations of the actor.

6. The universal adoption of common good approach poses the ethical dilemma of putting collective interests over and above the individual interests. Discuss with examples. 10

कॉमन गुड (सार्वजनिक शुभ) के दृष्टिकोण का सार्वभौमिक अंगीकरण व्यक्तिगत हितों के ऊपर सामूहिक हितों को रखने की नैतिक दुविधा खड़ी करता है। सोदाहरण चर्चा कीजिए।

Common good approach utilises the yardstick of common good in evaluation of individual action. It has elements of utilitarianism as it leads to greatest good of the greatest number.

This approach often leads to internal dilemmas where a person cannot decide on how to balance individual and collective interests.

- eg:
- ① A batsman batting on score of 99 needs 5 runs from a ball. He can either go for a six for victory but risks being caught and fails to register a century.
 - ② A Bureaucrat while taking bribes evaluates the pros and cons of personal benefit v/s social welfare.

③ A Doctor may recommend multiple treatments and medications for profits but risks putting the life of patients at risk.

The dilemma of personal gain v/s group gain often comes with an associated opportunity cost between equally appealing alternative universal adoption of common good approach would lead to low levels of motivation due to reduced incentives, less innovation and stagnation of the organisation.

Hence the best model is a balanced approach that juxtaposes individual interests with collective interests.

7. Compassion should never be considered as weakness, but rather as an essential element for providing a congenial administrative working environment. Discuss. 10

करुणा (संवेदना) को कभी भी दुर्बलता नहीं समझा जाना चाहिए, बल्कि सौहार्दपूर्ण प्रशासनिक कामकाज का वातावरण प्रदान करने हेतु एक आवश्यक तत्व माना जाना चाहिए। चर्चा कीजिए।

Compassion is the feeling of understanding that gives shared experiences, it leads to mutual recognition of problems making a person sympathetic and empathetic.

Compassion is often seen as a weakness that makes a person soft unable to take hard and decisive action. However compassion plays an important role in individual and group level.

① Compassion leads to a better work culture where difference in opinion is tolerated, heard to and discussed.

② It makes better accommodation to diversities such as gender, racial, ethnic, religious etc.

- ③ It leads to a system that has minimal friction, tension, working place politics, sycophancy etc
- ④ It leads to better decision making as it listens to all perspective creating a balanced approach.
- ⑤ It acts as a safety valve as it releases stress created by relative deprivation and inferiority

Compassion is therefore not a weakness rather a strength that gives robustness to an organisation improving governance outcomes and workplace chemistry.

8. Explain what you understand by the following values and discuss their importance for civil services: 10

स्पष्ट कीजिए कि आप निम्नलिखित मूल्यों से क्या समझते हैं और सिविल सेवाओं के लिए उनके महत्व की विवेचना कीजिए:

(a) Professionalism

व्यावसायिकता

Professionalism refers to a high degree of competency and efficiency in execution that comes from skills, training, expertise and experience.

Professionalism is necessary for civil service for effective service delivery, following the canons of propriety, impartiality, non partisanship and public service.

Professionalism helps in creating a good work culture, use of emotional intelligence, value neutrality and rationality.

The weberian model of bureaucracy presupposes professionalism making it an integral aspect of modern societies.

8. (b) Nishkama Karma or Selfless Action

निष्काम कर्म या निःस्वार्थ कार्य

Selfless action is action that is not driven by selfish motives for gain, profit, pleasure etc.

Selfless action is oriented towards the collective welfare of the society.

It forms the basis of public service where it is taken upon oneself to serve the people with no regard to personal glory.

Selfless action breeds the attitudes necessary for a responsive, flexible, efficient and sensitive bureaucracy.

SECTION – B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. There have been widespread protests both in favour of and against advancing reservation in educational institutions and government jobs to a certain section of the society. You are the chairman of a high level commission that was constituted to look into the matter. The commission has found no compelling reasons to provide reservation to this section and is about to submit its final report to the government.

Meanwhile, the government takes the decision to extend reservation to the section, turning the commission's findings inconsequential. You have also been requested to ensure that the final report supports the government's decision.

(a) Discuss the dilemma that you face in this situation?

(b) What course of action would you adopt and why?

(c) Also discuss the ethical issues involved with the policy of affirmative action in India. **20**

समाज के एक वर्ग विशेष हेतु शैक्षणिक संस्थानों और सरकारी नौकरियों में आरक्षण देने के पक्ष और विपक्ष में व्यापक विरोध प्रदर्शन हुए हैं। आप इस विषय की जाँच-पड़ताल करने के लिए गठित एक उच्च स्तरीय आयोग के अध्यक्ष हैं। आयोग ने इस वर्ग को आरक्षण प्रदान करने का कोई बाध्यकारी कारण नहीं पाया है और सरकार को अपना अंतिम प्रतिवेदन प्रस्तुत करने वाला है।

इस बीच, सरकार आयोग के निष्कर्षों को असंगत बताते हुए, इस वर्ग के लिए आरक्षण का विस्तार करने का निर्णय लेती है। आपसे भी यह सुनिश्चित करने का अनुरोध किया जाता है कि अंतिम प्रतिवेदन सरकार के निर्णय का समर्थन करे।

(a) इस परिस्थिति में आपके सामने आने वाली दुविधा की विवेचना कीजिए?

(b) आप क्या कार्यवाही अपनाएंगे और क्यों?

(c) साथ ही, भारत में सकारात्मक कार्यवाही की नीति से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दों की भी विवेचना कीजिए।

The above case is a classic example for demands for reservations seen in India with different communities agitating and mobilising.

(a)

Dilemmas faced in this situation.

(i) Following directions from the higher ups.

v/s

Using own faculties and exercising
prerogative and autonomy.(ii) Implementing a popular and politically
favourable solution

v/s

Merit based analysis where benefits
are given only to deserving classes.

(iii) Career prospects and progression.

v/s

Possible backlash for not complying.

(iv) Taking the easy way out by
bending to pressure

v/s

Setting the wrong precedent.

(b) Course of Action to be adopted.

I would adopt a graded approach.

- ① Objective, ~~dispassi~~ dispassionate and rational analysis of indicators and parameters
- ② Looking into specific root cause analysis as to why the group is demanding reservation and analysing whether the demand is justified or not
- ③ Finally engaging with both the higher ups and the group representatives where the applicability of reservation is discussed with cost benefit analysis.
- ④ Honest and impartial publication of reports on the basis of cold hard facts without any biasness or political leanings.
- ⑤ Including measures based on deprivation indicators to alluviate specific problems in case no reservation is allocated

- (c) Policy of affirmative action was envisaged as a tool for egalitarian social order where the historic disabilities and exploitation of marginalised classes is alleviated through reservations.

Over the last few decades the politics of reservation has deviated from its mandate giving rise to ethical concerns.

- (i) Vote bank politics → where numerically strong groups are wooed from votes of reservation.
eg:- Kapus in Andhra Pradesh.
Jats in Haryana.

- (ii) Competitive inequality → Various groups are involved in lobbying and mobilising to gain access to state benefits.

eg:- Marathas in Maharashtra
Patels in Gujarat

(ii) Caste tensions and fissures →

Groups that do not get reservation suffer heart burn and relative deprivation leading to animosity.

(iv) Emergence of Creamy layer classes →

Some groups have dominated the benefits leading to better status within the same community.
eg: Meenas in SC have monopolised the reservation benefits.

(v) Social Justice v/s Meritocracy debate.

Deserving people are cut out due to reservation of seats giving a perception of low efficiency & merit in public institutions.

Despite being a temporary measure the politics of reservation has become an integral part of the democratic landscape raising ethical and moral concerns.

10. You are an honest and responsible civil servant. You often observe the following:

(a) If one wants to remain effective and powerful to create impact on the lives of people, one should remain loyal to those in power.

(b) Following ethical means may not be practical and effective at all times.

(c) Petty corruption expedites the service delivery.

Examine the above statements with their merits and demerits.

20

आप एक ईमानदार और उत्तरदायी सिविल सेवक हैं। आप प्रायः निम्नलिखित का अवलोकन करते हैं:

(a) यदि कोई व्यक्ति लोगों के जीवन पर प्रभाव डालने के लिए प्रभावी और शक्तिशाली बने रहना चाहता है, तो उसे सत्ता में रहने वालों के प्रति निष्ठावान बने रहना चाहिए।

(b) नैतिक साधनों का अनुसरण करना हर समय व्यावहारिक और प्रभावी नहीं हो सकता है।

(c) छोटा-मोटा भ्रष्टाचार सेवा वितरण में तेजी लाता है।

उपर्युक्त कथनों का उनके गुण-दोष के आधार पर परीक्षण कीजिए।

(a) The statement tries to convey that remaining loyal to those in power has certain benefits which help in effective discharge of duties and roles.

MERITS

(i) low resistance as there is cooperation from higherups.

(ii) High degree of autonomy in personal jurisdiction

DEMERITS

(i) Impacts the impartiality and non partisan nature of civil services

(ii) Creates limitation on own preferences, thinking and understandings

- (iii) Access to resources, funding, manpower, infra etc to make discharge of duties efficient

as you may have to fall in line.

- (iv) Hampers accountability to the public as the bureaucrat feels obligation to the higher ups rather than public.

- (b) Following of ethical means always leads to a dilemma where a person decides on the basis of cost benefit analysis.

MERITS (of using ethical methods)

- (i) Does not create mental dissonance and unease that is seen in honest civil servants.
- (ii) leads to lower abuse of power and follows the rule of law & principles of natural justice.

DEMERITS.

- (i) Problems in implementation due to complexity. Time consuming and may not be practical in certain circumstances that need quick & decisive action.
- (ii) Hampers innovation and new methods that may be effective but grey in ethical evaluation.

(C) Petty corruption expediting service delivery is sometimes referred to as greasing of wheels that improve the efficiency of bureaucracy.

MERITS

- (i) Less time consuming
- (ii) Improves efficiency and efficacy of the office
- (iii) Incentivises work & innovation

DEMERITS

- (i) Creates differential access to services between those who can pay bribes and those who cannot.
- (ii) Gives encouragement to culture of corruption.
- (iii) Increases the cost of goods and services due to 'corruption tax'.
- (iv) Hampers ease of doing business
- (v) Alienates the poor and creates an apathetic image of the Bureaucracy.

Many steps have been taken to reform the civil services such as increased vigilance, digitisation, grievance redressal mechanisms, 360° appraisal feedback, lateral entry etc.

Despite these measure creating an ethical work culture and ethos would go a long way in creating a sustainable and robust ~~rob~~ model of good governance.

11. Recently, two national level sportspersons who are integral members of their team, made some comments in a talk show which were perceived as being grossly misogynistic and racist. This created a huge controversy and they were temporarily suspended from the team pending an enquiry. In light of these events, answer the following questions:

(a) Do you think public figures have an additional responsibility in so far as expressing their views on matters of public importance is concerned? Give reasons.

(b) According to you, what are the reasons that some prominent public figures make such misogynistic comments, and even get away without any consequences?

(c) As the person in charge to enquire into the conduct, what factors would you consider to examine it and what punishment, if any, would you prescribe in this specific case? **20**

हाल ही में, राष्ट्रीय स्तर के दो खिलाड़ियों, जो अपनी टीम के अभिन्न सदस्य हैं, ने एक टॉक शो में कुछ टिप्पणियां कीं, जिन्हें नारी-द्वेषी (माईसोजिनिस्टिक) और जातिवादी माना गया। इससे एक बहुत बड़ा विवाद उत्पन्न हो गया और उन्हें जाँच लंबित रखते हुए टीम से अस्थायी रूप से निलंबित कर दिया गया। इन घटनाओं के आलोक में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) क्या आप मानते हैं कि जहाँ तक सार्वजनिक महत्व के विषयों पर अपने विचारों को व्यक्त करने की बात है, सार्वजनिक हस्तियों पर अतिरिक्त उत्तरदायित्व होता है? कारण बताएं।

(b) आपके अनुसार, क्या कारण है कि कुछ प्रमुख सार्वजनिक हस्तियां इस प्रकार की नारी-द्वेषी (माईसोजिनिस्टिक) टिप्पणियां करती हैं और यहाँ तक कि बिना किसी परिणाम के बच निकलते हैं?

(c) इस आचरण की जाँच-पड़ताल करने वाले प्रभारी व्यक्ति के रूप में, इसका परीक्षण करने के लिए आप किन कारकों पर विचार करेंगे और आप इस विशिष्ट प्रकरण में क्या दंड, यदि कोई हो, निर्धारित करेंगे?

(a) The above case is a good example of phenomena of idolisation of celebrities seen in India and its impact on the fabric of society.

Public figures need to exercise extreme caution on the things that they say and the way they behave in the public sphere

Reasons

- ① Widespread reach and influence, all their actions are seen and evaluated by the masses something not seen in the case of a common man.
- ② Idolisation seen in India can lead to reinforcing of biases, prejudices and Stereotypes.
- ③ Imitation phenomena seen especially in the youth who act & behave like these public figures.

Due to the above reasons they have an additional responsibility in expressing their views on matters of public importance.

- (b) Reasons for making misogynistic comments by public figures
- (i) Perpetration of patriarchy in the society
 - (ii) No code of conduct for public figures especially on platforms of mass media
 - (iii) Absence of regulation and penal provisions that create a disincentive to voice such views.
 - (iv) Perception of larger than life image where there is no accountability for them and they can behave as they want.
 - (v) They usually get away even after making such comments as they are adored by the people. Making any example from them would lead to public backlash.
 - (vi) They get away even after making such comments as there is patriarchy present in the state, public and the celebrities so such statements appear normal

- (c) Factors to be considered during enquiry.
- ① Authenticity of statements made
 - ② Reasons behind making such statements and whether they are a product of misunderstandings.
 - ③ Whether they were making such comments intentionally or unintentionally.
 - ④ Whether the sports persons have shown regret / repentance after making such statements.

Punishment to be prescribed :-

- ① Tendering of public apology
- ② Pay cut and downgrading of contracts
- ③ Temporary suspension
- ④ Prescribing mandatory courses for gender sensitization and awareness.

These events happen due to absence of proper code of conduct of sportspersons outside the sphere of sports.

As the comments made by them have large scale ramifications it is important to regulate their public appearances and sensitising them to topics of public importance.

12. There are large number of leather industries in a major industrial town of India. They provide employment to large number of people and are also a prominent source of revenue for the state. Lately it has been observed that despite following the present emission control rules, the collective ecological footprint of these industries remains quite high affecting the surrounding areas in an adverse manner. The new technologies available for emission control are quite costly and thus acts as a disincentive for the owners of the industries for adopting them.

In light of this information, the government is contemplating the following options:

- (a) Shutting down the industries in the region
- (b) Relocating the industries to a new region
- (c) Making the emission control rules stricter
- (d) Providing incentives to the industry owners for adoption of new technology.

20

Analyse the above options in terms of their merits and demerits. What course of action would you choose and why?

भारत के एक प्रमुख औद्योगिक शहर में बड़ी संख्या में चमड़ा उद्योग हैं। वे बड़ी संख्या में लोगों को रोजगार प्रदान करते हैं और राज्य के लिए राजस्व के एक प्रमुख स्रोत भी हैं। हाल ही में यह देखा गया कि वर्तमान उत्सर्जन नियंत्रण नियमों का पालन करने के बावजूद, इन उद्योगों का सामूहिक पारिस्थितिकीय फुटप्रिंट काफी अधिक बना हुआ है जिससे आसपास के क्षेत्र प्रतिकूल रूप से प्रभावित हो रहे हैं। उत्सर्जन नियंत्रण के लिए उपलब्ध नई प्रौद्योगिकियां काफी महंगी हैं और इस प्रकार ये इन उद्योगों के स्वामियों द्वारा अपनाए जाने को हतोत्साहित करती हैं।

इस जानकारी के आलोक में, सरकार निम्नलिखित विकल्पों पर विचार कर रही है:

- (a) इस क्षेत्र में उद्योगों को बंद करना।
- (b) एक नए क्षेत्र में उद्योगों को स्थानांतरित करना।
- (c) उत्सर्जन नियंत्रण नियमों को और सख्त बनाना।
- (d) नई प्रौद्योगिकी को अपनाने हेतु उद्योगों के स्वामियों को प्रोत्साहन प्रदान करना।

उपर्युक्त विकल्पों का उनके गुण-दोष के आधार पर विश्लेषण कीजिए। आप क्या कार्यवाही अपनाएंगे और क्यों?

The above case is an example of how difficult it is to achieve sustainable development that is beneficial to all stakeholders & the environment simultaneously.

Option 1 → Shutting down the industries

PROS:

- (i) Limits the harmful effects on the environment
- (ii) Better quality of life due to less pollution

CONS

- (i) Loss of livelihood to the workers
- (ii) Loss of revenue to the State
- (iii) Impact on profitability of enterprises leading to losses

Option 2 → Relocating to a new region.

PROS

- (i) Preserves jobs
- (ii) Preserves revenue
- (iii) Preserves the profitability and viability of the industry.

CONS

- (i) Merely relocates the pollution without addressing the core issue
- (ii) Relocation cost of industry.

Option 3 → Making emission rules stricter

PROS

- (i) Preserves jobs
- (ii) Preserves revenue
- (iii) Reduces environmental impact

CONS

- (i) Upgradation costs to the business
- (ii) Lack of ease of doing Business

Option 4 | Providing incentives to the industry to adopt new technology.

Pros

- (i) Preserves jobs
- (ii) Preserves revenue
- (iii) Viability of industry maintained
- (iv) Voluntary adoption of new technology

CONS.

- (i) Time taking upgradation
- (ii) Incentives provided may lead to fiscal deficit
- (iii) May not be taken up by all owners voluntarily as upgradation is optional

Course of Action

I would prefer the last alternative

Reasons :-

- (i) Preserves employment & revenue
- (ii) Gradual reform rather than knee jerk reaction
- (iii) Reduced cost of upgradation for owners
- (iv) Does not alienate industry due to over regulation that can hamper future investments in the region
- (v) Most importantly is environment friendly.

Way Ahead →

The last measure needs to be supplemented by additional measures such as use of Cooperatives and SHGs to make the workers Stakeholders in the reform process and share the burden of technology upgradation.

Finally ecological sensitization needs to be done to improve community participation

13. Many coal mines in a district subject the workers to inhuman working conditions with little safety measures in place. As such, there have been several accidents and many workers have died in the past. In recognition of a recent accident where fifteen workers were trapped and died, the National Green Tribunal has ordered for closure of all such mines. Some of them have shut down, but many still continue to operate by getting an exception from the government, sometimes using the unholy nexus of politicians-miners-bureaucrats. In absence of alternative employment, the locals have no other choice but to work in mines. The mine owners are in-fact inciting the workers to protest to simultaneously put a pressure on the state to completely overturn the ban. As a District Magistrate of this district, you have been asked by the State government to prepare a report on this issue and give recommendations to resolve it. In this regard, answer the following questions:

(a) Identify the interests of State and analyse whether there may be a conflict amongst them?

(b) Given that economic growth is often achieved with a large human cost, identify the principles and strategies which could be used in the given case to achieve desirable outcomes. **20**

एक जिले के कई कोयला खदानों में श्रमिकों की कार्य दशाएँ अमानवीय हैं और उनकी सुरक्षा के उपाय नगण्य हैं। इस प्रकार, अतीत में कई दुर्घटनाएँ हुई हैं तथा कई श्रमिकों की मृत्यु हुई है। हाल ही में हुई एक दुर्घटना का संज्ञान लेते हुए, जिसमें पंद्रह श्रमिक फंस गए थे और उनकी मृत्यु हो गई थी, राष्ट्रीय हरित अधिकरण ने ऐसी सभी खदानों को बंद करने का आदेश दिया है। उनमें से कुछ को बंद कर दिया गया है, लेकिन अभी भी कई खदान, कभी-कभी राजनेताओं-खनिकों-नौकरशाहों के गलत गठजोड़ का उपयोग करते हुए, सरकार से छूट प्राप्त करके परिचालन जारी रखे हुए हैं। वैकल्पिक रोजगार के अभाव में, स्थानीय लोगों के पास खदानों में काम करने के अतिरिक्त और कोई विकल्प नहीं है। खदान स्वामी वास्तव में प्रतिबंध को पूरी तरह से समाप्त करने हेतु राज्य पर एक साथ दबाव डालने के लिए मजदूरों को विरोध करने के लिए उकसा रहे हैं। इस जिले के एक जिला मजिस्ट्रेट के रूप में, आपसे राज्य सरकार द्वारा इस मुद्दे पर एक प्रतिवेदन तैयार करने और इसका समाधान करने के लिए अनुशंसाएं देने के लिए कहा गया है। इस संबंध में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) राज्य के हितों की पहचान कीजिए और विश्लेषण कीजिए कि क्या उनके मध्य कोई संघर्ष हो सकता है?

(b) यह देखते हुए कि आर्थिक संवृद्धि प्रायः अत्यधिक मानवीय लागत के साथ प्राप्त होती है, उन सिद्धांतों और रणनीतियों की पहचान कीजिए, जिनका दिए गए प्रकरण में वांछित परिणाम प्राप्त करने के लिए उपयोग किया जा सकता है।

The above case study is based on the incidents of rat hole mining in Meghalaya which came under scrutiny after deaths of miners.

Interests of the State

- ① Provide livelihood opportunity that is safe and economically rewarding.
- ② Preserve and protect the environment
- ③ Attract industry investment through attractive incentives and opportunities
- ④ Augment the revenues of state.

Conflict

Between the first two and the last two. The state tries to bring industry and investment by attracting miners. The miners try to maximise profits by using rat hole mining techniques and providing poor working conditions. But the state fails to check this due to the unholy nexus.

(b) Balancing economic growth with human well being is the key objective of any public policy.

Using Deontological perspective we can say that the ends do not justify the means i.e. mere economic growth cannot paper over the cracks of human cost.

Principles

- ① Deontological ethics.
- ② Principles of natural justice and fair opportunity to the workers to be heard.
- ③ Sustainable development
- ④ Inclusive growth
- ⑤ Upholding rule of law as the NGT's directive has to be implemented

Strategies

- (i) Creating a social audit mechanism or 3rd party evaluation
- (ii) Upgradation of working conditions
- (iii) Upgradation of technology and the machinery/gear used by the miners

- (iv) Providing insurance cover and group funding
- (v) Creating a compensatory and liability mechanism which shall be borne by the miners in case of non compliance
- (vi) Better regulatory rules to make enforcement of stipulations stricter
- (vii) Unionisation of workers to give them better bargaining power
- (viii) Reskilling, upskilling of workers to move away from such industry gradually
- (ix) Other alternative employment mechanisms using SHGs, Cooperatives, MSMEs and Entrepreneurships.

The workers are exploited due to lack of alternative, skills and bargaining power making them voiceless entities that can be exploited.

It is the responsibility of the state to step in change the status quo.

14. Recently you were posted as a District Magistrate of a predominantly agricultural district, which has been one of the best performers in agriculture since the last decade. In one of your field visits, you find that the large landowners, who are a socially, politically and economically powerful group, employ domestic helps and agriculture labour who are informally tied to them and have been working there since generations. In return, these workers are provided basic amenities like food and shelter apart from some money. However, you do sense a violation of basic human rights in this situation.

In light of the above case, answer the following questions:

(a) Identify the stakeholders, their interests and ethical issues involved in the case.

(b) How does denial of choice amount to violation of human rights?

(c) What course of action would you take? Give reasons.

20

हाल ही में आपको प्रमुखतया कृषि आधारित एक जिले के जिला मजिस्ट्रेट के रूप में पदस्थापित किया गया है। यह जिला पिछले दशक से कृषि में सर्वश्रेष्ठ प्रदर्शनकर्ताओं में से एक रहा है। एक ग्रामीण क्षेत्र के भ्रमण में आप पाते हैं कि बड़े भू-स्वामी, जो सामाजिक, राजनीतिक और आर्थिक रूप से शक्तिशाली समूह हैं, ऐसे घरेलू सहायकों और कृषि मजदूरों को नियोजित किए हुए हैं, जो अनौपचारिक रूप से उनसे बंधे हुए हैं और पीढ़ियों से वहां काम कर रहे हैं। बदले में इन श्रमिकों को कुछ पैसे के अतिरिक्त भोजन और आश्रय जैसी आधारभूत सुविधाएं प्रदान की जाती हैं। फिर भी, आपको इस परिस्थिति में मूलभूत मानवाधिकारों के उल्लंघन की अनुभूति होती है।

उपर्युक्त प्रकरण के आलोक में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) इस प्रकरण में सम्मिलित हितधारकों, उनके हितों और नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।

(b) किस प्रकार चयन की वंचना मानवाधिकारों का उल्लंघन है?

(c) आप क्या कार्यवाही करेंगे? कारण बताएं।

(a) Stakeholders in the Situation

- (i) large landowners
- (ii) Poor labour and domestic help
- (iii) State / Govt
- (iv) Society at large
- (v) Yourself

Ethical issues involved :-

- ① Livelihood opportunities v/s violation of basic rights
- ② Profitability of landowners v/s Exploitation of labourers
- ③ Role of State in providing employment and basic amenities v/s Role of state in protecting rights
- ④ Freedom of choice of employment to workers v/s Informally tying them to landowners making them equivalent to slaves.

(b) Denial of Choice as violation of human rights →

- (i) As a person is not able to choose from alternatives he/she cannot do what is best for them.
- (ii) It does not create an enabling environment where a person's skills and aspirations are developed

Rather it creates a closed and rigid system that forces people to its will.

- (iii) Availability of alternatives is linked to bargaining power as the person can leverage threat of leaving to gain better benefits from current employer.

(c) Course of Action

(i) Making the landowners aware of the violation of rights happening under them

(ii) Advise them to create a mechanism to give formal employment which is governed by contracts

(iii) Educate the labourers of legal provisions, their rights and entitlements

(iv) Rope in NGOs to aid the transformation of informal labourers to formal labourers and skill upgradation.

④ Enhancing govt's thrust to civic amenities such as shelter, food, water, sanitation etc.

Rationale

- ① Formalization of workforce
- ② Education and awareness generation in the educated class
- ③ Improve socio economic well being of the workers
- ④ State amenities would make the workers less dependant on landowners
- ⑤ Skill upgradation using NGOs opens new alternatives for the labourers.

