



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

24 OCT 2016

SUBMITTED IN 3 HOURS
RECEIVED

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 760)

Name of Candidate	Saurabh Suman Yadav		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	English	Registration Number	14092
Center	1211	Date	21/10/2016

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

INSTRUCTIONS

1. Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
2. There are FOURTEEN questions printed in ENGLISH.
3. All questions are compulsory.
4. The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
5. Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
6. Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
7. Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions is not more than 150 words each.

1. (a) Celebrities are paid huge amounts by companies for endorsing products that at times turn out to be harmful for the consumers. Examine the ethical dimensions involved in such instances.

10

Some of the most noted filmstars, sports person of our times have been endorsing carbonated soft drinks that have hazardous health impact due to high sugar content. While it pays them handsome rewards the consumer is adversely impacted. The ethical issues involved are

- Social responsibility : celebrities are considered as role models and hence their behaviour and endorsements should be in the interest of society
- Accountability : The celebrities take no responsibility for the adverse impacts of the product. This is evident from high number of endorsement for sugar drinks, indirect advertisements for alcoholic beverages and tobacco products
- Consumerism : The endorsements promote consumerism and materialism. For example people are frequently told to buy products to maintain social status
- Misleading and demotivating advertisements : Some advertisements like fairness cream has a very negative impact on society, specially among the youth

Non participation in welfare advertisements

Very few celebrities participate in advertisements about government schemes and other socially useful message.

To bring about changes in this attitude some reforms are needed. For example companies issuing misleading advertisements should be subject to heavy penalty. Celebrities should be held responsible for any adverse effects of products that they endorse.

1. (b) Lack of cleanliness in urban areas despite schemes such as the Swachh Bharat Abhiyan point to difficulties faced in bringing about attitudinal and behavioural changes. Discuss. 10

The urban areas is facing a huge cleanliness challenge with heaps of garbage lying around in the street posing health hazards apart from ruining the aesthetics of the city.

Schemes such as Swachh Bharat Abhiyan have created awareness about the cleanliness issue with celebrities and people from all walks of life coming forward and supporting the movement. However, the progress has been minimal.

One of the key reasons is the slow change in the attitude and behaviour of people. People still throw garbage on the road. Various research have pointed out that people still only care about their own houses and ignore the surroundings.

It is also known that rather than awareness certain 'nudges' have more impact on behaviour. For example if there is a ~~add~~ arrow pointing to the nearest dustbin or nearest public toilet, people are more likely to use the dustbin or the public toilet.

Thus a paradigm shift is needed
as far as cleanliness drive campaigns
are concerned.

2. (a) Issues around economic inclusion are not just about income gaps, there are many dimensions of moral and ethical choices as well. Discuss. 10

2. (b) Socially and economically marginalized women are used to make a profit, often at the cost of their own health and reproductive autonomy, in the name of commercial surrogacy. Discuss the ethical issues associated with commercial surrogacy in India. Should commercial surrogacy be completely banned?

10

Surrogacy is defined as a situation when one woman bears the child for another woman. There are many ethical issues associated with commercial surrogacy.

- It amounts to commercialization of the human body.
- The surrogates are often exploited for money and middlemen take a large part of the payment
- The baby is immediately taken away from the surrogate mother and thus can be a source of emotional distress
- Sometimes the commissioning parents disown the babies if they have some birth defects. This results in a complex situation where the future of baby is uncertain
- Surrogates may take up many surrogacy contracts thereby putting her own health at risk

Surrogacy is a tool that allows many couples who are otherwise unable to conceive to enjoy the bliss of parenthood. This commercial surrogacy shouldn't be completely banned in India. Instead, strict provision should be made to ensure that the surrogate mothers are not exploited. There should be laws defining citizenship of a child in all eventualities in case commissioning parents are from a foreign country. A well defined rule will also prevent the industry from going underground as is possible in case of complete ban.

3. (a) While discussing the ethical issues that journalists face on a regular basis, examine the causes of increased sensationalism in news media in recent times.

10

~~Sensationalization~~ is Sensationalization is the presentation of eye catching headlines and provocative news content which has little truth in them or are placed out of context.

The reason for increased sensationalism in the news media in recent times is examined below

- Competition - There is a huge competition for market share and channels are doing all they can to get maximum share of pie
- Vested interest: The media houses are controlled by large corporates and hence the program reflects ~~those~~ their interest rather than journalistic ethos.
- Decline in journalistic ethics: The journalists of our times have been involved in cases of blackmailing, presenting false news, involved in political lobbying. Hence the editorial standards are continuously declining.

on a regular basis journalists face decisions ~~that~~ between presenting news in a fair unbiased manner even at cost of profits. The choice is very difficult with increasing ~~concern~~ competition and viability concerns. However, if there shortcuts to profit is taken, it is detrimental to the future of journalism in particular and the country in general.

3. (b) What are the various sources through which humans can judge the correctness of their actions? In the context of public life discuss how these sources are important in offering a clear and practical guidance. 10

The various sources through which humans can judge correctness of their action are

- Legal : In the modern society most countries have codified laws and rules. For example discriminating against a person on grounds of caste is unlawful in India.
- Morals : Morals are sets of values that helps a person distinguish right from wrong. For example Kindness is a moral value. Hence that can be the criteria to judge the correctness of one's action
- Social norms : There are some norms acceptable in our society. For example we offer our seats to elderly in public transport.
- code of conduct : Many organizations have a defined code of conduct. For example government organisation define gifts above a certain value as bribe. Thus an official can clearly determine right and wrong.
- There are other approaches like utilitarian (maximum good to maximum number), rights based (focus on individual) or justice based (focus on justice delivery) that helps make decisions in complex situations.

In public life laws, rules, regulations lay the minimum standard for judging the action of a behaviour. In reality a person should have values of honesty, transparency, commitment, probity to actually take decisions that will benefit society at large.

For example an official might find ways of taking a favour such that it doesn't qualify as bribe as per law. However, if he is honest he will do more than what the law merely states and obey it in spirit rather than just letter.

4. (a) Should a person resort to leaking of information in case of wrongs done in the organization? Does it cause a conflict of interest between the personal, organizational and societal spheres? Discuss with examples. 10

Leaking of information in case of wrong doings in an organization is a choice between commitment to the organization and commitment to the society. Whether a person should resort to leaking depends on many variables like intent, response of the organization when the matter was internally escalated. For example if a pharmaceutical company is manipulating the results of a clinical trial and an employee has repeatedly raised this matter with the top management. However he has been silenced and no action taken. In such a circumstance leaking ~~may~~ is the last resort in the larger benefit of society.

It is a conflict of interest between organizational, societal and personal spheres

organizational- A person is expected to be loyal to the organization that he works for.

Social: An individual has responsibility for the overall well being of society

Personal: Sometime leak might be done for personal interest or vindication.

The following should be kept in mind
→ The organization should be given enough opportunity to correct the

wrong by escalating to top management and ombuds person

→ The leak should not be for narrow self interest. It should be in the larger public interest. For example leak of documents by Edward Snowden in USA exposed snooping by the USA government on its citizens.

→ Due care should be taken: As far as possible it should be ensured that privacy of people involved is not violated, people's lives are not put at risk. For example documents may contain address and family details of a person. Such detail should be blurred.

It can be said in conclusion leaking should be the last choice when all other options are exhausted and it must be done with due care.

4. (b) Competition, it is argued, spurs the best of performance, however, can it also instigate cheating and unethical behaviour? Discuss with adequate examples.

10

competition ~~it~~ leads to better performance through efficiency as people and organization try their best to ensure optimum utilization of resources. The telecom sector in India is an example. The call rates for customers dropped drastically when private sector was allowed and there was competition. Telecom service providers began to attract customers by providing best services at cheapest rates. The same is the reason for competitive bidding in government procurement and infrastructure projects.

Similarly after globalization ^{in 1991} the Indian companies became far more efficient when they were exposed to global competition.

However, there are also cases of cheating and unethical behaviour due to competition. Case in point is the recent instance where few cement companies were finned by Competition Commission of India for price fixing. This exposes the dark side of competition.

Even in the field of education we have seen students resorting to unfair means because they want to stand out despite tough competition. In Bihar the topper

of the state higher Secondary examination have been accused to cheating to score high marks.

It can be said in conclusion that while competition generally leads to better performance it is not the panacea.

there must be other checks and balances like a well functioning regulator to ensure that there are no instances of cheating or unethical behaviour.

5. (a) "A person may cause evil to others not only by his actions but by his inaction, and in either case he is justly accountable to them for the injury". Explain the statement giving one example each from personal and public life.

10

A person should be accountable for both acts of commission or omission. He can cause evil to others by his indirect action. For example if a District collector delays the payment of MNRGA wages, then he is causing harm to the people who have put in effort. These people may not be able to afford two square meal a day and may not be able to send their children to school.

The evil caused due to inaction is sometimes more indirect. For example if a teacher sees one student in his class bullying another and doesn't take any action, he is equally responsible for the harm caused to the aggrieved child.

Similarly if a person beats his wife he is causing bodily and mental injury to her. This is a result of his direct action. However, if his mother watches this every day and doesn't report it to the police, she is also responsible for the harm caused to the woman.

This concept has a great significance in public ~~of~~ services. There are many honest officers who do their work with the highest level of integrity and commitment. But, they have faltered at times in pointing out wrongdoing by others in their department. An officer ~~must~~ person should be made responsible for both acts of commission and omission.

5. (b) "A people that values its privileges above its principles soon loses both."
What does this quotation mean to you? Explain with an example. 10

Privileges refers to the benefits that a person is entitled to by virtue of holding a position. Principles are values that help a person decide on the right course of action. This statement holds very relevant, specially in case of a public office. If a person is more interested in the perks of the office, than he is in the actual contribution that office can make towards welfare, it will lead to a lot of problems. In some time he becomes indulgent, may be even corrupt and lose the office as well due to non-performance.

For example ~~if~~ there is a minister for agriculture and he is only interested in the privileges and powers of his office. He will be ~~more~~ indulging a lot, make a lot of foreign trips, enjoy the luxury. He will be ignoring the principles of his office that requires him to be honest, transparent, effective and capable of bringing a change.

He will ~~thus~~ be forced to be removed
from office due to non performance
under public pressure. Thus he
has already lost the principles and
will later loose the privileges.

6. Instances of atrocities against dalits despite stringent legal measures point to the fact that the problem is not one of legality only but a matter of entrenched social prejudices and attitude. In this context suggest some effective measures to address the issue holistically. 10

The instances of ~~dalit~~ atrocities against Dalits have been rising recently. ~~There has~~ The flogging of Dalits in Una, Gujarat received wide national attention. This is despite the stringent SC/ST Act. This is because laws alone cannot bring change in attitude. The caste system is still entrenched in Indian society. People from Dalit community still form majority in jobs such as sanitation, disposal of animal carcasses. Some of the atrocities is also happening when the dalits assert themselves as equals and the people of higher caste are unable to accept it.

Some measures of handle the issue are suggested below

- strict enforcement of the SC/ST Act by spreading awareness. It should also be ~~ensured~~ that there is no abuse of the act. Large scale abuse reduces the credibility.
- social and economic empowerment of dalits is another key area that needs lot of attention. Dalits are

generally the most backward in terms of access to health, education and financial services.

- community harmony should be encouraged. The local bodies can create programs at village or district level to bring the different caste closer to each other by forgetting their past rivalries. The community is the most powerful body to bring about the change.
- Effective implementation of programs meant for the dalits to ensure that they take the benefits of development.

All these measures put together should help in the reduction of atrocities against dalits.

7. What do you mean by 'anonymity in the civil services'? Explain why anonymity and neutrality are considered as important traits for civil servants.

10

Anonymity is the concept that a civil servant is not directly seen by the public and the minister answers to the parliament. In this way it ensures accountability of elected representatives. Anonymity is linked to two concepts - permanence and neutrality. Every five years a new government is appointed while the appointment of civil servants is permanent. Thus a civil servant, whose duty is to advise and work for the respective government, must maintain neutrality.

Anonymity and neutrality helps a civil servant perform his duty effectively without any ideological bias of political parties. In a way he is also insulated from public pressure.

Neutrality also ensures continuity of policy during transition of governments.

Anonymity is also a trait that prevents civil servants from seeking attention and working solely in public interest.

However, in recent times the anonymity has been seen eroding due to proliferation of media - especially social media. This needs immediate attention if the steep frame of our governance is to continue delivering.

8. Prescription of dresscode for women not only violates their liberty but also reflects outdated views on gender relations as well as proper conduct.
Comment.

10

There was a recent report about a college in Tamil Nadu that prescribed dress code for female students.

Such prescription amounts to violation of their liberty. A woman is free to wear whatever she wants. She is capable enough to make those choices for herself.

Such prescriptions are often a result of patriarchal mindset where a man dictates what a woman should wear and how she should conduct herself.

It is also an outcome to the view on gender relation that considers a woman inferior to men. The reality is very different. Women have achieved as much if not more when compared to men in ~~the~~ fields of education, business, government when they are given the opportunity.

Thus it requires that women be treated equal to men. Just as men have the freedom to wear what they like, women should have the same. Any restriction should apply equally on all genders.

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

9. You are DM of a very poor district in the hinterland of India. It has come to your notice that manual scavenging is widely prevalent in the district even though the new law prohibits manual scavenging in any form. Upon enquiry, you have found that the number of manual scavengers has been reported to be very low, however, hundreds of dry latrines in the district depict a different picture. You have also noticed two more important trends: first, most of the manual scavengers are Dalits, and second, in many of the cases they themselves go to the houses and request the owners to clean their toilets manually, as it would provide monetary benefits. The entire district administration has been criticized by the media and there is political pressure on you to manipulate the data in a way that it shows less number of manual scavengers in the district. Based on the given information answer the following:

1. Identify the ethical issues associated with manual scavenging.
2. List the options available to you in the given case. Evaluate the merits and demerits of each.
3. Discuss some feasible steps that you can take to control this serious problem.

20

This is a case where numbers of manual ~~scavengers~~ scavengers have intentionally been reported to be very low to present a rosy picture, even though the actual condition is very poor.

Ethical issues

The ethical issues involved in this case are as follows

- Right of a person to live with dignity: Manual scavenging violates the right of a person to live with dignity guaranteed under article 21 of the constitution
- Legal violation: This violates the prohibition of manual scavenging act 2012. Manual scavenging is completely

prohibited and the act has made provision for resettlement of manual scavengers.

- Prevention of discrimination on grounds of caste creed: The fact that most of the manual scavengers are from the scheduled caste is a clear indicator of discrimination.
- Negligence of duty: The district administration administration by under reporting number of manual scavengers is guilty of negligence of duty.

The options available in this case are as follows

1. Let the practice go on as it is now merits

- It gives the manual scavengers an employment opportunity
- Sanitation can be maintained

Demerits

- It is both illegal and immoral to let this continue as it violates Article 14 (right to equality) and article 21 of the constitution, more so because majority of manual scavengers are from SC.
- It poses significant dangers to the manual scavengers in terms of their health and personal safety.

2. Stop practice of manual scavenging and ~~punish those~~ take disciplinary action against people who intentionally reported low numbers

Merits

- It gives person right to live with dignity and engage in a ~~more~~ more productive profession
- As a district magistrate I will be performing my duties as per prevention of manual scavenging 2012 Act.
- The guilty officers will be discouraged from flouting norms in future

Demerits

- It might cause loss of employment and result in impoverishment
- There could be cases of open defecation that will rise as the latrines will not be cleaned.

Feasible Steps to prevent manual scavenging

- Creating awareness of the prevention of manual scavenging Act 2012 is the first step.
- Create proper arrangement for rehabilitation of manual scavengers, their skill development and employment opportunities
- Punishment as very low for violators to create deterrence.
- Funds from schemes such as Swachh Bharat should be used to construct toilets that don't involve manual scavenging.

10. You are SP of a district where the use of drugs is prevalent, especially among the youth. The neighbouring districts are also suffering from the same problem. There is a huge hue and cry in the national media about the drug issue and the government and political parties are pressurising the police and district administration to act on the issue. A big deal of drugs is busted by the police in your area and all the culprits have been arrested. However, even before you reach your office, a minister from the ruling party of the state calls and asks you to release few of the culprits. You have long suspected the role of many senior leaders in this drug menace of the state. You have also been informed by your juniors that a few officers who dared to act against people involved in drug dealings were transferred or suspended on wrong charges earlier.
1. Identify the options available to you.
 2. Evaluate the pros and cons of each of your options.

20

Facts of the case

- Prevalence of drug abuse among the youth and pressure on the district administration to act on the issue
- Pressure on the SP of the district to release a few suspected drug dealers because of vested interest
- There is a chance of me (SP of district) getting transferred for acting against drug dealers, as has happened in the past

options available

1. Release the culprits as per instruction from ministers.

Pros

- Saves me from transfer and brings me in the good books of ministers

CONS

- This is against the principles of honesty, integrity and probity in public service
- It will encourage the drug dealers to go scot free and the drug ~~men~~ menace will continue unabated
- I will not be performing my duties as need and will be against the code of conduct of a civil service officer

2. Ask the minister for written orders

pros

- The minister will not give a written order in all likelihood and I can proceed with the trial and conviction of the accused dealers
- It will be in line with the order of the supreme court where officers shouldn't act without written orders

CONS

- The government might transfer me to a different location.

3. Report the matter to my seniors and continue proceedings as per law

pros

- This action will be adhering to the chain of command and we will have a better chance to matter to logical conclusion

CONS

There is no apparent cons for this

option unless some of the senior officers are also compromised.

- ④ Report the matter to media and expose the minister.

Pros

- It will put the minister under pressure and force government to take action against other ministers with such vested interest.

cons

- It will amount to insubordination of duty.
- It might destabilise ~~governance~~ the government and effect administration.
- All other options should be explored.

Final decision

This is a serious case of conflict of interest of minister. A civil servant is bound to act for the welfare of the people with the principles of transparency, probity and integrity. Under ~~these~~ no circumstances should the minister be allowed to prevail. The first step is to inform seniors in writing and proceed with investigation. The minister should be reminded of his duty of public welfare and his links with drug dealers should also be investigated. A independent enquiry committee should

be recommended to get to the bottom
of this nexus.

11. You are the manager of a small hotel which maintains high standards of ethics in dealing with its customers. One day a person comes to your hotel and enquires about booking a room at your hotel. However, due to peak season, all rooms were already booked and hence the staff politely informed him about the unavailability. The person, however, was adamant and took this as a personal insult and started misbehaving with the staff present at the counter. Citing his political connection he also threatened the staff of severe consequences. Next day the person lodged a frivolous complaint with the police under the stringent SC/ST act. In his complaint he accused you and your staff of insulting him deliberately on the basis of his caste. He insisted further that he was denied a room at your hotel due to the caste he belongs to.

1. What are the options available to you?
2. Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.

20

The parties of this case are

- Person looking for hotel room: He has misbehaved with hotel staff and has registered a false case under the SC/ST Act.
- Me (Hotel manager): My interest is to keep the morale of the staff high and prevent any bad reputation to the hotel name. I am also responsible for defending my staff legally, specially when they acted in fairness and as per hotel guidelines.
- Hotel staff: They did their job as per guidelines and no face charges under SC/ST act

The options available to me are

- ① Ignore the incident and suspend the staff to pacify angry customer.

Pros

- The customer might take back the

case

- The reputation of hotel can be saved

cons

- It would be an unethical act and would amount to abdication of responsibility to protect my staff
- The other staff members will get demoralised
- I will become party to abuse of a legal provision (SC/ST Act)

- ② stand by staff, provide information about bookings on that day to police and other material like CCTV footage

pros

- It will be the morally and ethically correct thing to do
- It will boost the morale of staff

Cons

- The case might continue for sometime giving the hotel a bad name

- ③ File a defamation case against the customer

Pros

- It will put pressure on the customer to withdraw false case
- It will protect the hotel and staff members

cons

- It will mean entering into an expensive and long drawn out legal battle.

My objective in this case is to protect reputation of Hotel, defend me and my staff from charges under SC/ST Act and try and reconcile with the angry customer and persuade him to withdraw the case which is obviously false.

The first step is to provide police with all evidences to prove that hotel was actually fully booked and there were no vacant rooms. This will include booking schedule and CCTV footage may also be provided to prove misbehaviour by the customer.

~~If the customer~~ If the customer still doesn't agree to reconcile then defamation case may be filed against him.

12. You are the Health Secretary in a state where there is an outbreak of dengue and chikungunya diseases. There have been reports of negligent attitude of some private hospitals in the city. Also, the public hospitals do not have the required infrastructure and staff to meet such increased number of cases in a short span of time. Additionally, the staff is demoralised by the increased working hours and the public outrage. Despite the efforts of the local authorities this issue emerges year after year.
1. What are the immediate steps which should be taken in such a situation?
 2. Suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.

20

The immediate task at hand is to provide medical care to all those in need and take all possible steps to stop further spread of the diseases.

The immediate steps can be clubbed into following broad categories

Ensure medical care for all in need

- Set up special clinics at all government hospitals to provide service 24x7.
- Issue directive to all private hospitals to provide treatment at reasonable prices. There will be a penalty for non-compliance.
- I will try and get additional medical work force from neighbouring states and central government.
- Ensure special care for the most vulnerable i.e. children and elderly.
- I will also provide for special testing centres.

Communicate to avoid panic

- I will make provision for a toll-free helpline for information on hospitals and clinics
- Communicate an effective message to people that the diseases are curable and has a very little risk of mortality. This will prevent the stress on hospitals and save space for most critical patients
- Advertise in newspapers and local media about dos and don'ts.

Short term preventive measures

- Order immediate fumigation of most vulnerable areas
- Distribution of mosquito nets and other repellants to poor households

Human Resource

Apart from these measures incentives should also be designed for medical staff who are working overtime to boost their morale. This should be accompanied by disciplinary action with the negligent staff.

However, since these outbreaks can be an annual phenomenon and hence long term measures are necessary.

Prevention

- I will create an ~~annual~~ task force in the ministry who will be responsible

to take measures for prevention of ~~desea~~ the dengue and chikungunya

- Municipality will carry out routine fumigation
- special care will be taken after rainy season
- Municipalities and ULBs will be given notice in advance to ensure the mosquitoes don't find breeding ground

Preparedness

- A master plan will be created to tackle outbreaks based on the past year data
- Hospitals will be fully equipped with resources including manpower well in advance

communication

- Message will be communicated to people well before the outbreak season about not letting water clogging in their communities.
- In case of symptoms they will be having a list of clinics nearest to their locality to avoid confusion

13. As a Forest Officer, you are receiving increasing complaints of certain animals ruining the farms and causing damage to crops. This is creating an undue financial burden for the farmers who are in deep distress because of the uncontrolled damage. Consequently, the farmers are demanding you to put forward a request for culling of animals. You are an animal lover and against culling of animals. You had made efforts to control the menace but the population of animals has increased beyond the managing capacity.

1. What are the options available to you? Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.

2. Also suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.

20

This is a classic case of man-animal conflict. The parties involved and their interests are

- Farmers: They are suffering huge economic losses due to the animal.
- Forest officer: As a forest officer I have both interests: Preventing loss of farmers crop and ensure animals don't suffer any undue harm.

The options available to me are

① Recommend culling as per farmers demand
Pros

- This would save the crops of the farmers and save them from financial distress

Cons

- It would be morally wrong to kill animals
- It might lead to further demand for culling other animals
- It may disturb the ecological balance in the area

② Deny the request for culling

Cons

- I would not be performing my duties properly if I rejected the request without proper analysis. As a public servant I should be accountable and responsive to the need of the people
- It would continue to cause financial pros loss to farmers
- The animals would be saved from death.

③ Engage with farmers and try to work out other less cruel initiatives while saving crops

Pros

- This is a good balance as culling shouldn't be the first step
- Farmers will be involved in a participatory solution and hence more chance of acceptance

cons

- It might result in delay and cause crop damage.

Final choice

All efforts will be made along with farmers to trap and relocate these animals. We are in many ways responsible for their habitat degradation that results in these conflicts. In the

meanwhile data will be collected and analysed to avoid rash decision. culling is an extreme step and will be recommended only as the last resort.

Long term measures

- Vermins should be identified in advance through field study and steps should be taken to keep their population in check through methods such as sterilization
- Physical barriers to protect farm land should be explored wherever feasible
- A special force should be explored to keep this animal in check. This will involve participation from the community
- Research and development should be undertaken on knowhow to control these animals without culling.

14. Dr. A.K. Singh, a professor of medicine, is a prominent cardiologist. His personal financial investments include significant stock holdings in three publicly traded biotechnology firms. He is approached by one of these firms to be a lead investigator in a therapeutic trial of a novel agent for preventing tissue damage from myocardial infarction (MI). This will be a randomized double-blinded, placebo-controlled clinical trial (neither patient nor physician will know whether the drug under investigation or a placebo is being used in a given patient). Dr. Singh is quite familiar with the preliminary animal and cell biology work in the area and believes that there is an excellent chance that this new drug will result in a significant improvement in survival and reduce damage to the heart muscle. He even thinks this novel agent may reduce the risk of heart failure and irregular beats. Dr. Singh's group is one of the few cardiology groups fully prepared to carry out this investigation, which is why he was contacted. He cares for a large number of patients with MI and believes that he could enroll numerous patients efficiently. The drug will only be available to his patients if his group participates in the trial. The company is offering Rs. 25 lakh for each patient enrolled. As a lead investigator, he will become much better known and will likely experience an increase in referrals if the trial succeeds.
1. Is Dr. Singh's participation in this study appropriate? Justify your position.
 2. Does Dr. Singh have a conflict of interest? If so, what is the nature of the conflict? How could it be mitigated.
 3. How would the nature of the conflict of interest be different had he not already owned stock, but instead had been offered stock as a form of compensation for conducting the study?
- 20

1. Dr. Singh's participation in the study is not appropriate for the following reasons

- He is holding shares of the firm that is conducting these trials. Therefore in a way he has vested interest in the success of these trials. Medical trials are a serious matter with the wounds of life at stake and hence should be conducted in an absolutely fair manner.
- Even if one doesn't doubt Mr. Singh's

Integrity, the issue is that there will be a perception of doubt. The process must not only be fair but also seem to be fair.

- He also has personal benefits in terms of referral and hence may impact the fairness and transparency of the process.

Even though there are compelling reasons for Mr. Singh's participation like his expertise in the subject, safeguards like double blinded placebo controlled trials and the interest of patients, Mr. Singh's participation will not be appropriate.

2) Mr Singh has conflict of interest

- The first conflict is between the result of the trial and his personal wealth in terms of shareholding. A favourable result will boost his wealth.
- The second conflict is between his participation and his reputation that will be boosted. He might be motivated by this fact and this could exclude several deserving experts from participating in trial.

③ If Mr Singh would have been offered the stock as a compensation for conducting the study, the conflict would have still remained. This is because the long term value of the stock depends on success of trials like these. Mr. Singh would still be motivated to give a more favourable verdict.

The only difference is the timing of the ownership of the stock.

If Mr Singh wants to participate in this study for the welfare of patients he should sell his shares of this company. He should also maintain complete anonymity to avoid accruing any undue benefit.

