



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in



GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 747)

Name of Candidate	Manish Guwari		
Medium Hindi/Eng.	Eng	Registration Number	14654
Center	Mukherjee Nagar	Date	19/10/16

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5(a)	10	
5(b)	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	20	
14	20	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in HINDI and ENGLISH. इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory. सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छाड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

EVALUATION INDICATORS

1. Alignment Competence
2. Context Competence
3. Content Competence
4. Language Competence
5. Introduction Competence
6. Structure - Presentation Competence
7. Conclusion Competence

Overall Macro Comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

6.

All the Best

Answer the following questions is not more than 150 words each.

1. (a) A broad ethical framework as a guiding light for international relations will not only ensure harmonious relations between nations but will also lead to progress of the human race. Discuss with examples. 10

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के लिए प्रकाश स्तंभ के रूप में एक व्यापक नैतिक ढांचा न केवल राष्ट्रों के बीच सामंजस्यपूर्ण संबंध सुनिश्चित करेगा बल्कि मानव जाति का विकास भी सुनिश्चित करेगा। सोदाहरण चर्चा कीजिए।

International relations is a dynamic process dealing with divergent national interests and overall world-development in mind. Hence, a broad ethical framework governing international relations is vital.

- Ongoing conflicts and differences of opinions: While several parts of the world Ex: Syria are going through conflicts, international players have a role to play there. Difference of opinion between USA & ~~the~~ Russia and other major world powers haven't allowed the conflict to settle. In this case, ethical framework underlining peace, justice, harmony will be vital.

- International Aid: International financial institutions such as World Bank, IMF have been accused of promoting only developed world's interest. A framework emphasising on equality, mutual benefit will benefit.

- Bilateral conflicts: India-Pakistan clash on terrorism, ~~for~~ China's muscle flexing in south China sea etc are dispute which require a well-defined framework.

Hence, a broad framework would not only eliminate conflicts but also lead to progress of human race stressing on balanced/equitable development.

1. (b) What does inequality mean to you? What are the different kinds of inequality? Is inequality morally wrong? 10

असमानता से आप क्या समझते हैं? असमानता के विभिन्न प्रकार क्या हैं? क्या असमानता नैतिक रूप से गलत है?

Inequality literally means unequal holding of resources. These resources may be of social, economic, political, gender (sex-based) in nature. When the resources are concentrated in few hands, leaving a significant proportion of people empty, this is known as inequality.

Inequality is manifested in several forms: Economic inequality: poverty, unemployment etc, social inequality: caste based discrimination; Political inequality: political power concentrated in some hands; Gender inequality: leaving women/transgenders etc out of the prism are several forms.

Morality, in general term, stresses on fair treatment of each human being. Inequality, being a case for unequal distribution, violates this entire idea of treating everyone fairly. With grave inequality coming in, ideas of justice, autonomy, peace, compassion seem to be taking back seat. Hence, inequality is immoral because

of the grave implications associated with it.

2. (a) One has a moral responsibility to disobey unjust laws. In light of this statement, examine the relevance of civil disobedience in a modern democratic society. Discuss the duties and responsibilities of a law enforcing officer in such situations. 10

अन्यायपूर्ण कानूनों की अवज्ञा करना हमारा नैतिक दायित्व है। इस कथन के प्रकाश में, आधुनिक लोकतांत्रिक समाज में सविनय अवज्ञा की प्रामाणिकता का परिक्षण कीजिए। ऐसी परिस्थितियों में एक कानून प्रवर्तन अधिकारी के कर्तव्यों तथा दायित्वों की चर्चा कीजिए।

The idea of civil disobedience is relevant since historical times. Mahatama Gandhi / Martin Luther etc have always practiced / preached not following of unjust laws.

In a modern democratic society, as people become aware of their rights Ex: Women / Disabled / Transgender / Minorities / Debt ridden farmers, they seek justice. During this seeking justice process, they have a right to democratically protest and disobeying laws, they consider to be unjust (They need to be ready to tolerate the repercussions and consequences too). Hence, the idea of civil disobedience is still prominent in today's democratic discourse in the pursuit of rights and balanced development.

In such situations, a law enforcing officer has dual responsibilities. One, to enforce rule of law i.e. to avoid ~~the~~ violence, to allow peace to prevail, to stop hijacking of such

movement by some anti-social elements. At the same time, he needs to be compassionate and open to listening to grievances of citizens. A balanced approach requiring rule of law - supremacy and stressing peaceful resolution of conflict is essential.

2. (b) Ensuring accountability in the administration just adds another layer in the bureaucratic process. Examine. Differentiate between accountability and responsibility. Suggest some measures through which administrative accountability can be made more effective in India. 10

प्रशासन में जवाबदेही (Accountability) सुनिश्चित करना नौकरशाही प्रक्रिया में एक और स्तर जोड़ देता है। परीक्षण कीजिए। जवाबदेही और उत्तरदायित्व (Responsibility) के बीच अंतर स्पष्ट कीजिए। कुछ ऐसे उपाय बताइए जिससे भारत में प्रशासनिक जवाबदेही को और अधिक प्रभावी बनाया जा सके।

The idea of Accountability is twin-faced.

It has aspects of Answerability & Enforcement.

Accountability means that the holders of public office are accountable (to Parliament via legislative measures, to executive and to people). The idea is to ease bureaucratic decision-making by taking people together in the decision-making. Prime fix, it seems that accountability adds another layer in the process but it actually makes the decision-making more efficient / equitable and participative. Ultimately, the so-called rigid layers are diluted and an efficiency bureaucracy evolves.

Responsibility, on the other hand, is link between an action and causing agent. It stresses on the individual dynamics between action and agent while Accountability is ensured through well-developed framework.

- For ensuring administrative accountability, strengthening of institutions like Lokpal/CVC; making Right to Information more vibrant and mass-based; prescribing a Code of Ethics, leveraging IT technologies at every stage, can be done.

3. (a) "Morality is based neither on the principle of utility, nor on a law of nature, but on human reason. But human reason can be fallible." Comment., What does morality mean to you? 10

"नैतिकता न तो उपयोगिता (utility) के सिद्धांत पर आधारित है और न ही प्रकृति के नियम पर, बल्कि यह मानवीय विवेक पर आधारित है। किंतु मानवीय विवेक दोषपूर्ण हो सकते हैं।" टिप्पणी कीजिए। आपके लिए नैतिकता का क्या अर्थ है?

Morality, in general, is commonly accepted mode of behaviour. This commonly accepted mode of behaviour does not emanate from the law of nature, nor it does follow utility principle; All that it sees is that these standards have been accepted by people/society in general and thus are moral in nature.

This reliance on human perception of what other people/society think, is open to flaws. Because, in this definition, critical reflection on those standards of society is missing. When one doesn't critically analyze one's belief and standards at every stage, such notion of morality is bound to be fallible and rather inappropriate.

My morality, other than common perception via society, family, learning etc also has an element of critical thinking. It also has scrutiny of

Those very standards which are otherwise considered to be sacrosanct. Hence, my morality is little more calibrated, wider than perception of what is commonly accepted.

3. (b) For effective public service delivery, the need today is to move from traditional accountability mechanisms to social accountability through greater civic engagement. Discuss with examples. 10

प्रभावी सार्वजनिक सेवा वितरण हेतु, जवाबदेहिता (Accountability) की पारंपरिक प्रणाली के स्थान पर अधिकाधिक नागरिक भागीदारी के माध्यम से सामाजिक जवाबदेही प्रणाली की ओर अग्रसर होना वर्तमान समय की आवश्यकता है। उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

For ensuring effective delivery of public services, accountability mechanisms need to be ~~re~~ redefined. Without denying the utility of traditional legislative / executive / financial (audit) accountability, the essence today, lies in people's participation leading to a regime of social accountability. Several examples:

- Discussion with people in law-making: When an act is being framed, comments from people are invited so as to make the process participative. This in turn, ensures accountability of legislative framework.

- Social Audit: Several govt schemes need to be strengthening via scrutinizing them by the people who are the beneficiaries. The Social Audit model has been found to be successful in MGNREGA / PDS etc.

- Municipal bodies / local bodies: Through making people part of the decision making, PRIs also emphasize the need of civic engagement.

- In education/health too, School Management Committee, Mohalla clinics etc are steps which not just make people participate but also enhance the accountability of public officers for public services.

4. (a) What do you mean by social justice? Explain with examples, why it is imperative for a society to promote social justice. 10

सामाजिक न्याय से आप क्या समझते हैं? उदाहरण सहित व्याख्या कीजिए कि सामाजिक न्याय को प्रोत्साहित करना किसी समाज के लिए क्यों अनिवार्य है?

Social justice, as an idea, is multi-dimensional and has very facets. It means socially a complete No to discrimination, stressing on individual's liberty to choose profession of his/her choice, moving away from a caste-based 'hierarchy', sense of fair treatment to vulnerables such as Disabled/ Transgender/ Scheduled Castes etc.

Overall, it is justice when accepted as a social norm.

- In a diverse society which is made up of people of different calibres/ different abilities, different histories, caste, sex, religion etc; it becomes imperative to promote social justice.

- Recent Una violence in M.P. stresses that the lack of social justice may not just disrupt the otherwise peaceful fabric of society but also causes grave law + order troubles.

- Recent Patidar agitations/ Jat agitations with the ideas of 'social justice' and 'equality' have posed a thorough challenge to the administrative machinery.

- In a diverse society, for it to collectively grow, it is essential to ensure everyone's fair treatment, otherwise the society might not reach its full potential.

4. (b) Investigative reporting by media can be a significant source of information on corruption. What are ethical issues involved in investigative journalism? What safeguards can be introduced to prevent its misuse? 10
- मीडिया द्वारा खोजी (इनवेस्टिगेटिव) रिपोर्टिंग भ्रष्टाचार संबंधी सूचना का महत्वपूर्ण स्रोत हो सकती है। खोजी पत्रकारिता से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं? इसके दुरुपयोग को रोकने के लिए कौन से सुरक्षा उपाय आरंभ किए जा सकते हैं?

- Investigative reporting by media consists of methods of informal investigation to get to the depth of the issues and has helped in information on corruption. There are several ethical issues:

- Undermining the actual law enforcement agencies
The agencies such as CVC/CBI/Anti-Corruption bureau etc are empowered to gather information and take corrective measures. Investigating reporting by media can undermine them.
- 'Vigilante justice': The idea of justice may take a backseat with anarchy prevailing.
- 'Corruption / Coercive measures': Media houses can end up indulging in corrupt practices to either abandon the piece of information or modify it to suit their context.
- Principle of Natural justice may also be violated as the other party often doesn't have the opportunity to respond.

Safeguards:

- 1) Guidelines by Broadcasting Authority to promote

ethical standards.

- 2) Natural justice : Allowing the party to express its views.
- 3) Strengthening of law-enforcement agencies.
- 4) Training framework for journalism should stress the need for truth and not sensationalization.

5. (a) While transplantation of organs represents one of the most spectacular achievements of modern medical science, it has raised many ethical issues as well. Discuss. Also, examine the issues related to organ transplantation in India. 10

यद्यपि अंग प्रत्यारोपण आधुनिक चिकित्सा विज्ञान की सर्वाधिक प्रभावशाली उपलब्धियों में से एक का प्रतिनिधित्व करती है, तथापि इसने कई नैतिक मुद्दे भी खड़े किए हैं। चर्चा कीजिए। साथ ही, भारत में अंग प्रत्यारोपण से जुड़े मुद्दों का भी परीक्षण कीजिए।

• Transplantation of organs has many ethical issues such as:

• Commercialization:- With transplantation of organs taking place, a whole market dealing with human organs is emerging with intermediaries.

• Inequality: Is the transplantation affordable for lower sections of the society? The element of unaffordability by poor people is also there.

• Exploitation of poor people: With poor, destitutes may be forced to sell their organs such as Kidneys. This exploits the poor and puts undue pressure on them.

• Medical standards: With the growing market for organ transplantation, is the ethical standards for medical profession being followed, is a tough question to ponder over.

In India, though there is National Organ Transplantation - organization exists. Yet,

There still remains some regulatory issues other than the ethical issues aforementioned.

- Lack of budget for the organisation/ lack of awareness/ lack of penetration of medical expertise are some of the other issues.

5. (b) There can be honesty without integrity, but no integrity without honesty. Do you agree? Justify your stand with examples. 10

सत्यनिष्ठा के बिना ईमानदारी संभव है, किंतु ईमानदारी के बिना सत्यनिष्ठा संभव नहीं है। क्या आप इससे सहमत हैं? उदाहरण सहित अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

Honesty and Integrity are inter-linked concepts. Integrity stresses on consistency of standards, beliefs, principles etc. while honesty is a principle of being honest, leading to a virtue. 'Integrity' says that a person should always apply his/her principles irrespective of the situations that he/she faces.

Hence, integrity i.e. consistency of principles has a principle named honesty enshrined in it. On the other hand, there are cases where an individual is honest but not consistent with this and hence, suffers from lack of integrity.

Example: An IAS officer posted somewhere is an honest officer, always stressing on the audit mechanisms to enforce. Yet, on a particular occasion, under the influence of a seasoned politician, he ~~not only~~ allows a malpractice to go unnoticed, though without generating any kind of entitlement for him. In this

case, he is honest but doesn't have integrity as he succumbed to the pressure of a politician.

- While integrity in itself stresses the need for principles including honesty.

6. "It is not always the same thing to be a good person and a good citizen." Explain the meaning of this statement and analyse its implications for a democratic society. 10

"अच्छा व्यक्ति होना और अच्छा नागरिक होना हमेशा समान बात नहीं होती है।" इस कथन के अर्थ की व्याख्या कीजिए और लोकतांत्रिक समाज के लिए इसके निहितार्थों का विश्लेषण कीजिए।

The statement says that being a good person and a good citizen are not one and the same always. Sometimes, one can be a good person but not a good citizen or vice-versa. In a democratic society, one has to be fulfilling his/her citizen civic responsibilities as well as promoting good interpersonal relations with other people of the society.

During our thrust on civic responsibilities, one may end up being considered as a bad person often being branded as too idealist. This happens in cases where an individual tries to be a good citizen but does not become popular as keeping civic interest over individual interest generates some sense of unpopularity.

The implications are that an individual is caught up in a dilemma as to whether he should keep his civic responsibilities ahead or he should rather stay in the good book of others.

7. Value of compassion towards the weak extends the limits of operations of a public servant by introducing flexibility but dilutes the principle of objectivity. Discuss. If a conflict arises between the value of compassion and principle of objectivity, how will you deal with it as a public servant? 10
- कमजोर के प्रति करुणा की भावना रखने की महत्ता किसी लोकसेवक के कार्यक्षेत्र की सीमाओं में लोचशीलता लाकर उसे विस्तारित करती है, किंतु वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत को निर्बल करती है। चर्चा कीजिए। यदि करुणा की महत्ता और वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत के बीच संघर्ष पैदा होता है, तो एक लोक सेवक के रूप में आप इस परिस्थिति से किस प्रकार निपटेंगे?

Compassion essentially try to understand the situation of the weak from their perspective as well as having a desire to change.

With this compassion in mind, there seems to be an ethical conflict with objectivity.

Objectivity essentially means that the decision-making should be based on empirical-evidences,

sound reasoning and there should be no element of preferences, biases, prejudices etc.

Hence, prima facie Compassion seems to be diluting the objectivity.

As a civil servant, this dilemma is quite popular. To solve this, few things need to be kept in mind:

1) Understanding that objectivity deals with empirical evidences and there is enough empirical evidence available to suggest the plight of the weak.

2) 'Idealism is deeply rooted in pragmatism'

Making positive intervention in the interest of vulnerable is a constitutional feature and nothing new/illegal about it.

3) Efforts should be made that compassionate actions should have an element of objectivity and hit at the root of the problem.

8. Which administrator had a lasting impact on your decision to join the civil services and why? Should administrators have increased media presence so that the common man can know more about their efforts and achievements? Justify your stand. 10

किस प्रशासक ने लोक सेवाओं में सम्मिलित होने के आपके निर्णय पर अमिट छाप छोड़ी और क्यों? क्या प्रशासक को मीडिया की उपस्थिति को बढ़ाना चाहिए जिससे सामान्य जनता उनके प्रयासों और उपलब्धियों के बारे में अधिक जानकारी प्राप्त कर सके? अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

While, India has produced several seasoned administrators. To count one, for me, it has to be 'Metro man' E. Sreedharan. An officer of the Indian Railway Engineering officer, he made an everlasting impact on the lives of millions of people.

- High efficiency & work-ethics: Finishing a tough project like Konkan railway within the time frame with great accuracy & efficiency, is something that I always wanted to learn from him.
- Leading from the front: One could find him not just in his chamber but also on the field, wearing security helmets guiding engineers/workers as to what should be done.
- Zero tolerance on Corruption: Considered to be a no non-sense officer, he is known to be a man of integrity.
- Handling diversity of projects: Delhi Metro, advisor in Tripura metro indicate the diversity.

Administrators have to ensure that their work is not just done but also seen to be done. This arouses people's participation in the process and inspires millions to join hands in nation's development. Media presence is a vital tool for this. All this, should be done, however keeping in mind Civil Services Conduct Rules, 1964, and without undue politicisation.

9. You are a Secretary in a government department. Your Minister has proposed an unemployment grant, which is expected to cost the public exchequer heavily. Having already taken the decision, he asks you to come up with research to support the scheme. Despite your best efforts, you fail to find socio-economic benefit in it. You approach the Minister with relevant facts and studies and ask him to reconsider his decision. Instead, he asks you to suppress the negative impacts and actively promote the scheme through mass media as the percieved social impacts are more important than economic impacts.

Elections are due in a short time and the political party currently in power is expected to win. You are also due for promotion at the same time. You are expected to fully cooperate in the situation and make the scheme a success, however flawed its foundations may be.

- (a) List the different stakeholders in the above situation and mention their prospective interests.
- (b) Discuss the ethical dilemma which you face in this situation.
- (c) Some of the alternatives for you to handle the situation could be:
- Do as asked by the Minister.. ✕
 - Insist on publication of results and let the public decide whether it wants the scheme.
 - Call a press conference and brief the media about the results and the callous attitude of the Minister. ✕

Suggest any other possible option(s). Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

आप एक सरकारी विभाग में सचिव हैं। आपके मंत्री ने बेरोजगारी भत्ता का प्रस्ताव स्वीकृत किया है, जिससे सरकारी खजाने पर अत्यधिक बोझ पड़ने की संभावना है। चूंकि उन्होंने पहले से ही इस पर निर्णय ले लिया है, अतः वे इस योजना के समर्थन में आपसे शोध करके आने को कहते हैं। आपके द्वारा सर्वोत्तम प्रयास किए जाने के बावजूद भी, आपको इसमें कोई सामाजिक-आर्थिक लाभ दिखाई नहीं पड़ रहा है। आप संबंधित तथ्यों और अध्ययनों के साथ मंत्री के पास जाते हैं और उनसे अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने का आग्रह करते हैं। चूंकि इस योजना के कथित सामाजिक प्रभाव, आर्थिक प्रभाव की अपेक्षा अधिक महत्वपूर्ण हैं, अतः अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने की अपेक्षा वे आपसे इसके नकारात्मक प्रभाव को छिपाने और इस योजना को जनसंचार माध्यम की सहायता से सक्रिय रूप से प्रचारित करने को कहते हैं।

कुछ ही समय बाद चुनाव होने वाले हैं और वर्तमान सत्तारूढ़ दल के जीतने की संभावना है। इसी समय आपकी प्रोन्नति भी होनी है। आपसे इस स्थिति में पूर्ण रूप से सहयोग करने तथा इस योजना को सफल बनाने की अपेक्षा है, भले ही इसके आधार ऋटिपूर्ण हों।

- (a) उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में विभिन्न हितधारकों की सूची प्रदान कीजिए और उनके संभावित हितों का उल्लेख कीजिए।
- (b) इस परिस्थिति में आपके समक्ष उत्पन्न नैतिक दुविधा की चर्चा कीजिए।

(c) इस परिस्थिति से निपटने के लिए आपके पास कुछ विकल्प हो सकते हैं:

- जैसा मंत्री ने कहा है वैसा कीजिए...
- परिणामों को प्रकाशित करने का आग्रह कीजिए और जनता को निर्णय करने दीजिए कि क्या वह इस योजना को चाहती है या नहीं?
- एक प्रेस कॉन्फ्रेंस कीजिए और इस योजना के परिणामों तथा मंत्री के संवेदनहीन रवैये के बारे में मीडिया को संक्षिप्त वृत्तांत दीजिए।

कोई अन्य संभव विकल्प सुझाइए। उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और अपने कारण बताते हुए उनमें से सबसे अच्छे विकल्प को सुझाव दीजिए।

a) The situation has stakeholders like the officer who is secretary of the department, the Minister, Public exchequer on which the burden of the scheme will fall, The beneficiaries (intended) of the scheme

- The interests of Secretary: Being a civil servant, he is duty-bound to be objective and rely his decision-making on empirical evidences. He also needs to be conscious about the fiduciary responsibility i.e. the burden on the exchequer. Being a civil servant, he has to have respect for political executive (Minister). His civil service conduct rules also tell him to be respectful towards political executive and not indulge in indiscipline. Promotion is pending

- For the minister: As minister is elected on popular will, there is high possibility that he is eyeing on short term electoral gain. (as elections are due in some time). He has also

asked the secretary to publicise the scheme on mass media. He also ~~sees~~ sees some perceived benefits of social nature and has already taken the decision.

- Public exchequer: Exchequer is also bound to face the burden of the scheme if implemented.

- Beneficiaries (intended) of unemployment grant are stakeholders too. People, due to cast their votes, in some time, also may get influenced.

b) I, as a secretary, face below mentioned ethical dilemmas:

(i) Objectivity v/s hierarchy: I am bound to be objective and weigh decisions on the basis of cost-benefit analysis at the same time; I also have to be respectful to the hierarchy which keeps Minister at the helm.

(ii) Public interest v/s Personal interest: As I am due to get promoted in some time, the dilemma is whether to convey my disagreement to the Minister or in the public interest or keep it happen in my personal interest.

c) Several options available to me:

- Accepting what the Minister says: will undermine my fiduciary responsibility, objectivity and

will suppress the public interest over my personal interest (promotion). It may set a wrong precedent as civil servants are duty bound to give critical advice to political executive

2) Insisting on publication of result and let the public decide: The insistence/repeated requests to minister to consider his stand is advisable. By suggesting him to be aware of enormous burden on exchequer, with due diligence, this might consider change in his stand.

3) Calling a press conference is a clear cut violation of civil service conduct rules and undue politicisation of the issue. Civil servants don't sensationalise, they ^{work}

→ A better alternative, at this stage, is to first focus on holding deliberations/discussions with Ministers holding in front of him credible evidence in for/against the scheme objectively; this may allow a reconsideration of his stand.

→ further, if still he doesn't agree, the idea is to have your disagreement on paper with due credible evidence. File notes are crucial aspect of critical advice offered by civil servants

to minister.

→ In a chain of command, a civil servant may also apprise PM's office (PMO) of the dilemma and seek clarifications/valuable suggestion. This will also scuttle chances of any kind of victimization.

→ Media, at this stage, needs to be avoided as it will unduly sensationalize the matter. Strength and solution lies in discussions keeping in mind civil service conduct rules.

10. The International Money Bank has granted loan to the government to construct ten dams. The dams would provide water for irrigation of crops, control floods in some parts of your district, and supply drinking water to numerous towns and cities. Seven of these dams are to be constructed in areas of high ecological value occupied by native groups who are challenging the government. The native groups, who oppose the construction of the dams, represent a minority compared to the multiple towns and cities which would benefit from the dams.

Nevertheless, it should be taken under consideration that the natives consider the forests as their own. Also, their distinctive life style and culture is intimately related to the existence of these natural areas. It has been noted that the forests also have a very high ecological value. If this project is completed, their land would submerge and the natives would have to be relocated. The International Money Bank is aware of this yet it has granted the loan.

You are the District Magistrate of this district. Every day protests and demonstrations are happening in your office. The government has given you the responsibility to manage the situation.

What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक ने दस बांधों का निर्माण करने के लिए सरकार को ऋण की स्वीकृति प्रदान की है। ये बांध फसलों की सिंचाई, आपके जिले के कुछ भागों में बाढ़ को नियंत्रित करने तथा अनेक कस्बों और शहरों में पेयजल आपूर्ति के लिए जल प्रदान करेंगे। इनमें से सात बांध, स्थानीय आदिवासी समूहों, जोकि सरकार के इस निर्णय का विरोध कर रहे हैं, के नियंत्रण वाले ऐसे क्षेत्रों में निर्मित किये जाने हैं जो उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्व के हैं। बांधों के निर्माण का विरोध कर रहे आदिवासी समूह, बांधों से लाभांशित होने वाले अनेक कस्बों और शहरों के जनसंख्या की तुलना में अल्पसंख्यक जनसंख्या का प्रतिनिधित्व करते हैं।

फिर भी, यह अवश्य ध्यान रखा जाना चाहिए आदिवासी वनों को अपना समझते हैं। इसके अतिरिक्त, उनकी विशिष्ट जीवन शैली और संस्कृति इन प्राकृतिक क्षेत्रों के अस्तित्व से घनिष्टता से जुड़ी हुई है। पुनः ध्यान देने योग्य बात यह भी है कि वनों की अत्यधिक उच्च पारिस्थितिक महत्ता भी है। यदि यह परियोजना पूरी हो जाती है तो उनकी भूमि जलमग्न हो जाएगी और आदिवासियों को अन्यत्र स्थानांतरित करना पड़ेगा। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय मुद्रा बैंक इस तथ्य से अवगत है किन्तु फिर भी इसने ऋण स्वीकृत कर दिया है।

आप इस जिले के जिलाधिकारी हैं। आपके कार्यालय में प्रतिदिन विरोध और प्रदर्शन हो रहे हैं। सरकार ने आपको स्थिति को नियंत्रित करने की जिम्मेदारी दी है।

आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प मुझाइए।

In this case, International Money Bank has granted ^{loan} to construct dams which are essential for irrigation, flood-control and drinking water.

As the natives protest because of emotive attachment, fear of ~~de~~^{se} relocation, ecological concerns, I am caught up in a dilemma. The dilemma can be ended up several alternatives such as:

- 1) Go ahead with construction of dam: As the dams are of high value from irrigation, flood-control & drinking water perspective; they need to be given a go-ahead. Protests of natives may be handled by law & order machinery in ensuring that the situation doesn't go out of turn.
- 2) Concern of Natives: Keeping in mind the high ecological value of forests, threat to distinct identity & culture of natives, fear of situation taking a violent turn and going out of turn, and the emotive attachment, the natives hold to the forests, I may suggest the government to not go-ahead with the dam projects as this will be of great ecological, economical, societal damage.

However, the pragmatic solution lies somewhere in the middle. As suggested by Buddhism, extremes may be avoided and ~~the~~ middle path should be chosen with due concentration, right knowledge, right perception etc.

Alternative:

• Deliberations & Discussions with the Natives:

Being an administrator, I have to be compassionate with the demands of the people whether minority/majority. In this case, efforts should be made to make the natives understand the enormous and multi-dimensional benefits that dam can offer to the society as a whole, keeping in mind the grievances of natives.

• Thorough ecological study/study of loss of natives:

A thorough and reasoned impact assessment should be done to weigh & understand the implications of the dam if the project is given a go-ahead. The study must also include loss of economic value/livelihood of the natives. Places for compensatory afforestation and relocation need to be charted out so that the interests of environment & natives both are taken care of.

- Keeping law & order machinery on alert: While allowing the consultations to take place, efforts should also be made to ensure that no anti-social element takes advantage of the situation and pose any threat to law & order situation.

Hence, the solution lies in winning hearts & minds of the native, thorough environmental & economic impact assessment of the ~~people~~ project, increasing awareness about the benefits that the project is supposed to bring & protecting the livelihood of the natives.

11. You recently joined the civil administration as a young District Commissioner. As a part of fulfilling their electoral promise, the new government in the state announced total prohibition on production, sale and purchase of liquor. This has not only led to smuggling of liquor from neighbouring states but also production of illicit liquor in the state, known as hooch. Women of the area decide to go on a protest against the recent hooch tragedy wherein several people lost their lives owing to consumption of illicit liquor. The political authorities scapegoat you for mismanagement.

(a) What are the issues involved in this case?

(b) What are the various options available to you. Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it. 20

आप हाल ही में एक युवा जिला आयुक्त के रूप में नागरिक प्रशासन में सम्मिलित हुए हैं। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करने के संदर्भ में, राज्य में नई सरकार ने शराब के उत्पादन और खरीद-बिक्री पूर्ण प्रतिबंध की घोषणा की है। इसके परिणाम स्वरूप न केवल पड़ोसी राज्य से शराब की तस्करी बल्कि राज्य में 'हूच' नाम से प्रसिद्ध अवैध शराब का उत्पादन भी आरंभ हो गया है। आपके जिले की महिलाओं ने हाल ही की एक हूच त्रासदी के विरुद्ध विरोध-प्रदर्शन करने का निश्चय किया है, जिसमें कई लोगों ने अवैध शराब के सेवन के कारण अपनी जानें गवाई थी। राजनीतिक प्राधिकारियों ने उक्त कुप्रबंधन के लिए आपको बलि का बकरा बनाया है।

(a) इस मामले में सम्मिलित मुद्दे क्या हैं?

(b) आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और चयन करने का कारण स्पष्ट करते हुए सर्वोत्तम विकल्प सुझाइए।

a) There are several issues involved in the case relating to administrative aspect to law & order aspect to societal point of view.

- As a civil administrator, I am duty bound to implement govt's policy, in this case, policy of total prohibition on production, sale & purchase of liquor.

- In implementing this, I am also bound to stop illicit production of liquor as well as smuggling, as these are grave law & order

issues posing threats and I am duty-bound to deal with it.

- I am also supposed to uphold the principle of justice in which I need to ensure that justice is given to people suffered because of illicit production.

Hence, the issues are my duty to implement govt's policy, stopping smuggling of liquor and illicit production, justice to people who died, law & order preservation. Of course, the debate about whether total prohibition is a remedy or malaise, is something to ponder over too.

As I have been made scapegoat by political authorities, I also have to defend myself from the tyranny so that any arbitrary action is not initiated against me.

b) Several options available to me:

- To enforce the policy at best way possible:

The policy needs to be implemented in its letter and spirit as it ~~is~~ is a political executive's decision and I am bound to implement it.

- Measures should also be taken to ensure that no illicit trade/production takes place. Strengthening of law & order machinery is equally important too.
- While implementing the policy decision and take measures to stop illicit production, what is of paramount importance is Social awareness about alcoholism and its pernicious impacts. Without winning people's minds, without making them part of the scheme, it is practically impossible to implement Total prohibition.
- Civil society organisations should also be leveraged to ensure that the message reaches to the grass roots.
- Focus on De-addiction centres: People who are already addicted are more prone to smuggling network and illicit consumption; efforts should be made to ensure proper rehabilitation and de-addiction facilities in order to make people more responsible about their choice.
- Health administration: should be strengthened, in the meantime, to deal with cases relating

to health impacts post consumption of illicit liquor.

- Consultations/discussions with protesting women and making part of the strategy is a suitable choice.
- On administrative front, I need to defend myself and highlight the measures taken by me so that any arbitrary action is not initiated against me.
- Of course, accepting the scapegoat theory and do nothing about it, are the possible alternatives which stand no merit, as a civil servant, I have to be proactive in my approach.

12. You are a doctoral student at a large university in the final months of your research on a potentially revolutionary technology. Meanwhile, you have also applied for post-doctoral research cum teaching positions at various universities. To your pleasant surprise, you get an interview call from your undergraduate alma mater, a prestigious research institution in a city where you would love to live.

In the interview, the department chair asks for detailed information about your research.

Your group is working on a patent application and its members have agreed not to provide details until a paper currently being prepared is submitted for publication. You explain the situation and tell them that you would be glad to send them an early preprint when it is available.

But the Chair pushes harder for this information, remarking that the Department seeks team players, willing to share information with department colleagues. She also appeals to your undergraduate connection with the institution.

(a) Enumerate the ethical issues involved in the case in light of your current responsibilities vis-a-vis future expectations.

(b) Discuss the possible motivations of the department chair in pressing you for detailed information.

(c) What stand will you take in such a situation? Give reasonable justification for your arguments. 20

आप एक प्रख्यात विश्वविद्यालय में किसी संभाव्य क्रांतिकारी प्रौद्योगिकी पर शोध कर रहे हैं और शोध पूरा होने में कुछ ही महीने शेष बचे हैं। इसी बीच, आपने विभिन्न विश्वविद्यालयों में शोध सह-अध्यापन पदों के लिए भी आवेदन किया है। आपको एक सुखद व आश्चर्यजनक समाचार प्राप्त होता है कि आपको स्नातक स्तर की उस संस्था से साक्षात्कार के लिए बुलावा प्राप्त हुआ है, जहाँ से आपने शिक्षा प्राप्त की है जो एक ऐसे नगर में स्थापित प्रतिष्ठित संस्थान है जहाँ रहना आप पसंद करेंगे।

साक्षात्कार में विभागीय अधिकारी आपके शोध के संबंध में विस्तृत सूचना मांगती हैं।

आपका समूह एक पेटेंट आवेदन पर कार्य कर रहा है और इसके सदस्य इस हेतु सहमत हुए हैं कि जब तक वर्तमान में तैयार किया जा रहा शोध पत्र प्रकाशन के लिए जमा न कर दिया जाए, तब तक कोई विवरण किसी अन्य को प्रदान नहीं किया जाए। आप परिस्थिति समझते हैं और उन्हें कहते हैं कि जब शोध पत्र उपलब्ध हो जाएगा तो आपको उनके लिए उक्त शोध पत्र का नमूना भेजने में प्रसन्नता होगी।

किंतु विभागीय अधिकारी इस सूचना के लिए अत्यधिक दबाव देती हैं। वह यह स्पष्ट करती हैं कि विभाग ऐसे लोगों की नियुक्ति चाहता है जो टीम के रूप में साथ मिलकर काम कर सकें और विभागीय सहयोगियों के साथ सूचना साझा कर सकें। वह संस्था के साथ आपके स्नातक स्तरीय संपर्कों का भी वास्ता देती है।

- (a) अपनी वर्तमान जिम्मेदारियों और भविष्य की अपेक्षाओं को सामने रखते हुए इस प्रकरण में शामिल विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
- (b) आपसे विस्तृत जानकारी हेतु दबाव डालने के संबंध में विभागीय अधिकारी के संभावित उत्प्रेरणाओं पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) ऐसी स्थिति में आप क्या निर्णय लेंगे? अपने तर्क को औचित्यपूर्ण सिद्ध कीजिए।

ethical issues involved in the case:

- 1) Interest of a group of which you are a part of vs personal interest:

As being a member of research team of the potentially revolutionary technology, I am supposed to uphold Secrecy so that no one takes undue advantage of it (as the research is in final stage). At the same time, the job offers a research cum teaching position at a prestigious university. This brings in dilemma about my personal interest over the right to confidentiality about research of a revolutionary technology.

- 2) Dilemma about balancing your current university with the connection with the undergraduate university: Having a sort of connect with my undergraduate university, I may generate a tendency to fall for it. This needs to be balanced with my current position.

3) An agreement was done by the group members not to divulge any information until publication submission. I am bound to face the dilemma whether I should respect the sanctity of the agreement or I should look for the immediate job offering.

b) The Department chair may have varied motivations in pressing ~~me~~^{me} about information:

1) Checking my integrity: As I have already told the chair that I am ready to share the details once preprint is done, she may be willing to check whether I give in to her repeated persuasion or I stand up for the stand that I had earlier taken.

4) As she told that the department is seeking team players who can share information, she wants to check how duty-bound I am towards my current team players and gauge my overall personality out of the decision that I take during the interview. After all, she is interviewing me and needs to make a proper assessment.

3) She may also be interested in knowing

the acute details of the project because of her interest/ malafide intensions or this may be well because of curiosity, very difficult to gauge this.

- c) At such juncture, I will respectfully tell the chair that I am a follower of high ethical work standards, as I have done an agreement with my current team players not to divulge information before preprint. I am supposed to be holding high ethical ground and confidentiality.
- I will also underline that my refusal in letting her know the details, in itself, is a indication of how good a team player I am, worthy of her consideration.
- All this, I will do with highlighting my skill-set for the job prospect that the department is offering, with all my humility.

13. You have recently been appointed as the District Collector of an impoverished district, which has been witnessing drought for the last couple of years. Corruption at lower levels of bureaucracy has further aggravated the situation. The district also faces the problem of diminishing resources of drinking water. Despite, the gravity of the problem, the response from the central and the state government is lackadaisical. Moreover, the media coverage of the problem is also dismal. To make matters worse, the younger members of the community are migrating in search of work to the urban areas without much success, leaving the elders, women, and children behind to fend for themselves.

(a) As the District Collector what would be your priorities for solving the problem?

(b) How would you tackle the situation?

(c) What long term measures would you take to prevent the future recurrence of the problem?

20

आपको हाल ही में एक अत्यंत पिछड़े जिले के जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में नियुक्त किया गया है। उक्त जिला पिछले कुछ वर्षों से सूखे की चपेट में रहा है। नौकरशाही के निचले स्तर पर व्याप्त भ्रष्टाचार ने परिस्थिति को और गंभीर बना दिया है। यह जिला, पेयजल स्रोतों के गिरते जल स्तर की समस्याओं का सामना भी कर रहा है। परिस्थिति की गंभीरता के बावजूद भी, केंद्र और राज्य सरकार की प्रतिक्रिया चिंतनीय है। इसके अतिरिक्त, उक्त समस्या की मीडिया कवरेज भी निराशाजनक है। स्थानीय समुदाय के नौजवान सदस्य बुजुर्गों, महिलाओं और बच्चों को अपने भरण-पोषण की व्यवस्था स्वयं करने हेतु छोड़कर काम की खोज में शहरी क्षेत्रों, की ओर पलायन कर रहे हैं, जहां उन्हें अपेक्षित सफलता प्राप्त नहीं हो रही है। इससे यह स्थिति और बदतर होती जा रही है।

(a) जिला कलेक्टर के रूप में उक्त समस्या के समाधान के लिए आपकी प्राथमिकताएँ क्या होंगी?

(b) आप इस स्थिति से कैसे निपटेंगे?

(c) इस समस्या की भावी पुनरावृत्ति को रोकने के लिए आप कौन-से दीर्घावधिक उपाय अपनाएंगे?

The situation, as explained in the passage, is quite a complex one, considering the divergent issues ranging from water scarcity, lack of employment avenues, vulnerable such as elders & women, and corruption & neglect etc.

a) As a District Collector, my priority would be to work for attracting the attention of the government towards the grave situation being faced by the district. Civil society ~~about~~ and Media should be used to get the desired attention on the issue. This may lead to greater allocation of funds by the state govt.

- On the other hand, I'll also work for promoting skill development & employment avenues for the youth so that the migration can be stopped and the ~~is~~ worsening situation of elders, women and children may be bettered.

- Issues of water management, drought management, soil moisture regeneration for agriculture, need large scale intervention and I'll invite expert opinion to study the situation and suggest remedial measures. Corruption also needs to be addressed.

b) For tackling the situation, as mentioned in the ~~the~~ priority, immediate attention needs to be garnered by highlighting the plight of the district in front of the state government.

Taking local representatives in confidence and putting pressure on state govt ~~will~~ be useful.

- Generating employment avenues: Skill-development schemes/ Wage employment schemes (MGNREGA) needs to be used as remedial measure in order to give some sense of security to people who are suffering. Local cottage/ village industry

may also be promoted taking women & olders together, with due diligence to local factors.

- These employment initiatives will not work if the corruption in the lower bureaucracy is persistent.

- Because of the corruption, Public Distribution System may also be suffering.

c) During long-term, measures relating to ground-water recharge, water-conservation, education, skill developments, Transparency in administration needs to be promoted. Greater civic engagement

is the key in ensuring that fruits of
social security schemes reach to the masses.

14. In a district, in which you are posted as a District Magistrate, a teacher molests a child in a government run school. As the news of this crime spreads, the parents, relatives and locals gather at the school. The culprit teacher has meanwhile fled. The police arrests the Principal of the school and assure the crowd that the culprit would be arrested soon. The crowd, however, has gone berserk and begins to damage the school building. It wants immediate arrest of the culprit and is not ready to budge until he is arrested.

(a) Is it correct to take the Principal into custody when he has personally not committed the crime? Support your answer with appropriate reasons.

(b) What options do you have in dealing with the crowd? Enumerate the merits and demerits of each and also suggest the best possible option.

(c) In the capacity of District Magistrate what would be your long term plan to prevent molestations and rapes in the schools?

20

एक जिले में जहां आप एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में पदस्थापित हैं, वहां के एक सरकारी विद्यालय का एक शिक्षक एक बच्चे से छेड़छाड़ करता है। जब इस अपराध की खबर फैलती है तो उस बच्चे के माता-पिता, सगे-संबंधी और स्थानीय लोग विद्यालय के पास एकत्रित हो जाते हैं। इसी बीच आरोपी शिक्षक फ़रार हो जाता है। पुलिस उस विद्यालय के प्राचार्य को गिरफ्तार कर लेती है और भीड़ को यह आश्वासन देती है कि आरोपी को शीघ्र ही गिरफ्तार कर लिया जाएगा। तथापि भीड़ अनियंत्रित हो जाती है और विद्यालय भवन को क्षतिग्रस्त करना आरंभ कर देती है। उक्त भीड़ आरोपी की तत्काल गिरफ्तारी चाहती है और जब तक उसे गिरफ्तार नहीं कर लिया जाता, तब तक वे वहाँ से हिलने के लिए तैयार नहीं है।

(a) क्या प्राचार्य को हिरासत में लेना सही है, जबकि उसने व्यक्तिगत रूप से अपराध नहीं किया है? उपयुक्त कारणों सहित अपने उत्तर का समर्थन कीजिए।

(b) आपके पास भीड़ से निपटने के कौन से विकल्प हैं? प्रत्येक के गुणों व दोषों की गणना कीजिए और सर्वोत्तम संभावित विकल्प सुझाइए।

(c) एक जिलाधिकारी के रूप में विद्यालयों में छेड़छाड़ और बलात्कार की घटना को रोकने के लिए आपकी दीर्घकालिक योजना क्या होगी?

a) The principal has not personally committed the crime but during investigation, it needs to be ascertained whether he had knowledge about the molestation of the child, was he negligent about any such mishappenings in the past, was there any step taken by him to prevent such incidents in the future.

Being, head of the school, the Principal is administratively accountable. For ascertaining the facts, a proper investigation needs to be carried out for establishing his role as an individual and as head of the school and then only, he may be arrested or not.

- The principle of our criminal justice system is to not let the innocents suffer. If he is arrested without him committing the crime/negligence on his part, this will be tyranny of justice. Hence, detailed investigation about Principal's role needs to take place before taking the decision of arresting him.

(2) In dealing with the crowd, apart from Coercive control measures, holding discussions in order to assuage their hurt sentiments, by assuring speedy arrest & investigation of the accused are some of the alternatives.

- In calming down the crowd, local political representatives may also be roped in.
- Excessive coercive measures will only vitiate the atmosphere. Due diligence should be paid in ensuring that any further damage is not done to school building which is a public property, ~~and~~ at the same time ensuring that the crowd understands that coercion/ vigilante justice is not the solution and they should let the law of the land take its own course.

- Discussions/ talks seem to be a better option after curbing the immediate violence.

(3) In long term plans to prevent molestations & rapes in school:

- Sex education needs to be promoted & children

should be told to raise their voices
when something of this sort happens.

- Sensitization of parents/ Training to teachers
is also essential.
- Recruitment of women staff in greater number
in ensuring gender equality.
- Certainty & swiftness in investigation of the
crime will cause a deterrence for any further
recurrence.

